



**FACULTY OF EDUCATION**

**THE ROLE OF ART IN EARLY CHILDHOOD EDUCATION IN  
PRIMARY SCHOOLS IN BOTSWANA: A CASE OF KGATLENG  
REGION**

A RESEARCH PROPOSAL SUBMITTED TO THE FACULTY OF  
EDUCATION IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS FOR  
THE AWARD OF THE DEGREE OF MASTER OF EDUCATION MED  
(EDUCATIONAL MANAGEMENT)

**BY**

PONATSHEGO VERONICA MMOLOTSI (200802545)

SUPERVISOR: PROFESSOR. M.B. MHLAULI

CO-SUPERVISOR: DR. M.C. MANNATHOKO

**AUGUST 2019**

**Approval Page**

This research proposal has been examined and approved as meeting the standards for the partial fulfillment of the Degree of Master of Educational Foundation.

-----

Supervisor

-----

Date

-----

Internal Examiner

-----

Director, Graduate Studies

-----

External Examiner

-----

Date

### **Statement of Originality**

The work in this Research Proposal was completed by the researcher at the University of Botswana. It is my original work and that all the sources that I have used or quoted have been indicated and acknowledged by means of complete references.

---

Author's Signature

---

Date

## **Dedication**

I dedicate this research proposal to my late father Ronnie Sekano. I hope you are watching me as an angel wherever you are. I love you so much. May your soul rest in eternal peace.

## **Acknowledgements**

First and foremost, I would like to thank God for giving me the strength to do this proposal. Without his grace I wouldn't have managed and I will forever be grateful to you the almighty.

Secondly, I would like to offer my profound gratitude to my supervisor Professor M. B. Mhlauli for her support during this proposal. She encouraged me and gave me all the necessary guidance throughout this process tirelessly. Your constructive criticism made me achieve what I have achieved today.

Thirdly, I would also like to thank my co-supervisor Dr. M.C. Mannathoko for her courageous support through the development of this proposal. Your encouragement and criticism inspired me to reach greater heights.

Importantly, I would like to thank my family, my sister Lindy Mmolotsi and my sons Sesame and Obusitswe Mmolotsi for according me time away from home developing this proposal. As well as their support, and encouragement towards the realization of my dream. I would also like to acknowledge my friend Kgomotso Mokalake for her support in my studies and provision of accommodation developing this proposal. Without you people I would not have achieved this. I will be forever grateful to you guys. I salute you.

Lastly, I would also like to thank my employer for the opportunity to further my studies.

## **Abstract**

*Art education and Early Childhood Education have been developing at a slow pace in the education sector in Botswana. The purpose of this study is to explore the role of art in Early Childhood Education, to find out if teachers use art in Early Childhood Education as well as to identify the challenges faced by teachers when teaching Early Childhood Education through the use of art. Reviewed literature on art and Early Childhood Education suggests that art plays an important role in the development of a child, therefore, must be taken seriously by governments. In Botswana, the development of Early Childhood Education has largely been in the hands of Non-Governmental Organizations, Faith-Based Organizations and the private sector with the government playing the role of policy development. Until recently, Early Childhood Education has been introduced in primary education as reception classes. Analysis in this discourse show that many teachers in Early Childhood Education are unqualified to teach in Early Childhood Education as mostly are females and non-citizens due to lack of training institutions in Early Childhood Education (Bose, 2008; 2010, Maunganidze & Tsamaase, 2014). Early Childhood Education in Botswana is faced with challenges of lack of a curriculum which therefore, leave it open for institutions to do as they wish. This study uses a qualitative research approach which is rich in its approach to studying social phenomena. The study will use classroom observation and in-depth interview for data collection. Observations of five pre-schools classes will be made. Observations and in-depth interviews are good for first-hand information and the in-depth interview method is suitable for probing of more information from participants. The pre-schools will be selected through purposive sampling technique. Teachers administering the selected classes from the sampled preschools will then be interviewed. The five pre-primary classrooms will be observed in Kgatleng region.*

**Key words: Art, Education, Art Education, Early Childhood Education**

## **List of Acronyms and Abbreviations**

AIDS: Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndrome

AU: African Union

BFTU: Botswana Federation of Trade Unions

BOU: Botswana Open University

CBO: Community-Based Organization

CSO: Civil Society Organisation

DBAE: Discipline Based Art Education

ECC: Ethiopian Children Commission

ECE: Early Childhood Education

ECCE: Early Childhood Care and Education

ECEC: Early Childhood Education and Care

EFA: Education for All

ETSSP: Education and Training Sector Strategic Plan

FBO: Faith Based Organization

GES: Ghana Education Service

HIV: Human Immunodeficiency Virus

LDCC: Lesotho Day Care and Community

LNCW: Lesotho National Council for Women

MoBE: Ministry of Basic Education

NCF: National Curriculum Framework

NDCP: National Day Care Centre Policy

NDP: National Development Plan

NGOs: Non-Governmental Organizations

PSE: Primary School Education

PSLE: Primary School Leaving Examinations

RNPE: Revised National Policy on Education

SDG: Sustainable Development Goal

SSA: Sub-Saharan Africa

UN: United Nations

UNICEF: United Nations Children's Emergency Fund

USA: United States of America

## Table of Contents

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| Approval Page.....  | ii  |
| Statement of Originality.....   | iii |
| Dedication.....   | iv  |
| Acknowledgements.....   | v   |
| Abstract.....   | vi  |
| List of Acronyms and Abbreviations.....                               | vii |
| List of Tables.....   | xii |
| Chapter 1: Introduction and Background of the study.....              | 1   |
| 1.0 Introduction.....   | 1   |
| 1.1 Background to the study.....                                      | 1   |
| 1.1.1 Overview of Botswana’s Education System.....                    | 3   |
| 1.1.2 History of Education in Botswana.....                           | 4   |
| 1.1.3 Art Education in Botswana.....                                  | 5   |
| 1.1.4 Art and Early Childhood Education in Botswana.....              | 7   |
| 1.1.5 Policy Directions in Early Childhood Education in Botswana..... | 12  |
| 1.1.6 Early Childhood Education and art education in Africa.....      | 14  |
| 1.2 Statement of the problem.....                                     | 17  |
| 1.3 The purpose of study.....   | 18  |
| 1.4 Research questions.....   | 19  |
| 1.5 Justification for the study.....                                  | 19  |
| 1.6 Significance of the study.....                                    | 20  |
| 1.7 Limitations of study.....   | 21  |
| 1.8 Delimitation of study.....  | 22  |
| 1.9 Theoretical framework.....  | 23  |
| 1.10 Summary.....   | 25  |
| Chapter 2: Literature Review.....                                     | 27  |
| 2.0 Introduction.....   | 27  |
| 2.1 The International Perspective.....                                | 28  |
| 2.1.1 The role of Art Education in Early Childhood Education.....     | 28  |
| 2.1.2 The role of teachers in Early Childhood Education.....          | 30  |

|   |    |
|---|----|
| 2.1.3 Art activities and perspectives in Early Childhood Education .....          | 33 |
| 2.2 The Regional /African Context.....  | 35 |
| 2.2.1 General information on Early Childhood Education in African Countries ..... | 37 |
| 2.2.2 Approaches to teaching art in Early Childhood Education.....                | 38 |
| 2.2.3 Challenges in Early Childhood Education in Africa.....                      | 41 |
| 2.3 The Botswana Context.....   | 43 |
| 2.3.1 Challenges facing Early Childhood Education in Botswana .....               | 46 |
| 2.4 Summary .....   | 48 |
| Chapter 3: Research Methodology.....  | 50 |
| 3.0 Introduction.....   | 50 |
| 3.1 Research Approaches.....  | 50 |
| 3.2 Research Design.....  | 52 |
| 3.2.1 A case-study.....   | 52 |
| 3.3 Research paradigms .....  | 53 |
| 3.4 Research site .....   | 54 |
| 3.5 Population of the study .....   | 55 |
| 3.6 Sample.....   | 55 |
| 3.7 Sampling techniques .....   | 56 |
| 3.8 Data collection methods.....  | 57 |
| 3.8.1 Classroom observation.....  | 58 |
| 3.8.2 In-depth interviews .....   | 59 |
| 3.9 Pilot of the study .....  | 61 |
| 3.10 Data analysis procedures.....  | 61 |
| 3.11 Trustworthiness of Research.....   | 62 |
| 3.11.1 Credibility .....  | 62 |
| 3.11.2 Triangulation.....   | 64 |
| 3.11.3 Member Checks .....  | 65 |
| 3.11.4 Transferability.....   | 65 |
| 3.11.5 Dependability .....  | 66 |
| 3.12 Ethical considerations .....   | 66 |
| 3.12.1 Obtaining informed consent.....  | 67 |

|  |    |
|--|----|
| 3.12.2 Confidentiality and anonymity ..... | 68 |
| 3.12.4 Beneficence.....                    | 68 |
| 3.13 Summary .....                         | 69 |
| References.....                            | 72 |
| Appendices.....                            | 87 |
| Appendix A: Interview Guide.....           | 87 |
| Appendix B: Observation Guide.....         | 89 |

## List of Tables

| Table.....   | Page |
|--|------|
| <b>Table 1:</b> Number of pre-primary school teachers by qualification, school ownership and sex-2014..... | 09   |
| <b>Table 2:</b> Number of pre-primary schools by district and terms of operation-2014.....                 | 11   |
| <b>Table 3:</b> Research Plan.....   | 71   |

## **Chapter 1: Introduction and Background of the study**

### **1.0 Introduction**

This study intends to investigate the role of art in Early Childhood Education (ECE) in Kgatleng region primary schools in Botswana. Art education plays an important role in the development of a child (Nompula, 2013). It is largely recognized in developed countries such as Australia, Japan, New Zealand and United States of America (USA) (Gunn, 2000; Wong, 2007; Garvis, 2012). While African countries lag behind. Mannathoko (2009) has argued that in Botswana, art is taught to pass time while important subjects have been done. Despite many policies developed to improve learning in Early Childhood Education, art is still regarded as an inferior subject not worth taught (Maunganidze & Tsamaase, 2014). This chapter provides the background information of the study, statement of the problem, research questions, purpose, rationale, significance, limitations, delimitations, theoretical framework and the summary.

### **1.1 Background to the study**

The idea of teaching art to young children is topical and can evoke much discussion and debate about the value of art, its place in society and schools, and how it is best taught (McArdle & Piscitelli, 2002). McArdle & Piscitelli (2002) have indicated that many exemplary art teachers and artists insist that they do not teach art to young children arguing that art comes from the children; children simply explore, experiment, and express themselves through art.

A close examination of these art teachers' and artists' practices invariably show that teachers guide, model, demonstrate skills and techniques, provide children with opportunities to practice and master skills, organize, and enact teaching in many number of ways. Even so, teachers

do not like to think or speak of their work as teaching. The work of art teachers and artists is described ironically as teaching, without teaching (McArdle & Piscitelli, 2002). Thus, playing the role of a teacher without necessarily teaching young learners to do art.

Research in early childhood and art education has enjoyed an increased amount of attention over the recent years (Wong, 2007, Kindler, 2010, Mannathoko, 2013, Mwamwenda, 2014 & Mahgoub, 2015). Research further shows multiple forces pulling in different directions, with policy statements emerging from the field of early childhood and the field of art education. Uncertainties are perpetuated in a number of common beliefs or “myths” about the nature of art, development and creativity of young children (Kindler, 2010). At the site where a young child is learning about art, there are points where ideas about the child, art and teaching meet, sometimes connecting, colliding, and competing.

Globally, art studies are not a new phenomenon. Art educators continue to strive for understandings which will lead to improvements in the quality and effectiveness of their work (Wong, 2007). In the fields of art education and young children, art educators argue that art should be taught early focusing on skills and techniques and develop towards mastery, originality and creative composition as children progress in education levels (Wong, 2007). Most of the existing literature in art education draws from western background. There is very little research in art education in Early Childhood Education in Botswana hence the need to conduct this study. This paper begins with the position that many children in Botswana do not necessarily fulfill their learning aspirations, desires and dreams as in most cases they are fulfilling their teachers’ and curriculum requirements as well as their parents’ aspirations and dreams of what their parents want them to become when they grow up. This section provides an overview of Botswana and discusses the history of education in Botswana, Early Childhood Education (ECE) in Botswana, art

education in Botswana, Art and Early Childhood Education in Botswana, the relationship between art and Early Childhood Education and Policy directions in Early Childhood Education in Botswana.

### **1.1.1 Overview of Botswana's Education System**

Botswana is a landlocked country situated in the southern part of Africa and shares its borders with Zimbabwe, the Republic of South Africa, Namibia and Zambia (Ntseane, 2004). Botswana is a mid-sized country with just over two million people and it is one of the most sparsely populated countries in the world (Republic of Botswana, 2011). Over 60 per cent of the population is comprised of the youth who are below 40 years of age (Republic of Botswana, 2015a). The provision of education in Botswana is a joint collaboration between the Government and Civil Society Organizations (CSOs) (Republic of Botswana, 2012). The government through the Ministry of Basic Education is responsible for quality assurance and standards from pre-primary to secondary level while the Ministry of Tertiary Education, Research, Science and Technology is responsible for tertiary, vocational and technical colleges (Republic of Botswana, 2012).

Botswana's basic education comprises of pre-primary, primary and junior secondary levels of education (BFTU, 2007 & Republic of Botswana, 2015b). Pre-primary education runs from two and half years to six years of age for children while primary education runs for seven years while junior secondary education runs for three years (BFTU, 2007 & Maundeni, 2013). Immediately after completing junior secondary, students go through two years of senior secondary education (Republic of Botswana, 2015b). The country's education system promotes universal access to primary and junior secondary education but a process of academic selectivity reduces entrance into the senior and the tertiary levels of education including universities (Republic of Botswana,

2015b). Education in Botswana is free but it is not compulsory and the Ministry of Basic Education has authority over all of Botswana's education system except for the University of Botswana and other private basic and tertiary education institutions.

### **1.1.2 History of Education in Botswana**

Pre-colonial Botswana did not have schools in the modern sense but young children were learning through traditional systems such as *bogwera* and *bojale* which were initiation schools (Denbow & Thebe, 2006). The traditional learning promoted traditional values and customs and various life skills for both boys and girls in the society (Mosweunyane, 2013). Immediately after independence in Botswana, education grew and changed to meet international standards hence the assimilation of Western education systems (Pheko, 2010). In 1977, the Botswana government formulated its first National Policy on Education which is popularly known as Education for *Kagisano* (Social harmony) which was anchored on four national principles of democracy, development, self-reliance and unity (Republic of Botswana, 2015a). The intention of the policy was to increase access to education for young children (Sikwibele & Mungoo, 2009 & Republic of Botswana, 2015a).

The government, therefore, embarked on a massive expansion of schools, and between 1979 and 1991, the number of primary schools had increased from 500 to 700, while the number of secondary schools rose from 23 to 230 (Sikwibele & Mungoo, 2009). The National Policy on Education (1977) became the guiding basis for the implementation of providing quality education and training in Botswana (Botswana Federation of Trade Unions, 2007). The emphasis was to equip learners with skills to enable them to enter into self-employment as well as create an opportunity for life-long learning. In the early 1990s, it was realized that the country's socio-

economic situation had changed significantly resulting in a review of policies and strategies for Botswana's educational development (Republic of Botswana, 2015a).

In 1990, the Education for All (EFA) conference was held in Jomtien, Thailand and declared education as a fundamental human right and emphasized the universal access to education (Republic of Botswana, 2015a). The Jomtien conference resulted in the World Declaration Education for All, which Botswana is a signatory to, whose aim was to increase educational opportunities (Republic of Botswana, 2015a).

As a result of the changes in the country's socio economic situations and the declarations of the Jomtien conference, the Revised National Policy on Education (1994) and the Vision 2016 were developed to provide direction for Botswana's educational system (Republic of Botswana, 2015a). The Revised National Policy on Education (RNPE) was founded on the country's long term Vision 2016 which accentuated the need to have "an educated and informed nation" (BFTU, 2007). Thus the Government has committed itself to improve access to pre-school education, provision of ten years of basic education, expansion of vocational and technical training and promotion of lifelong learning (BFTU, 2007).

### **1.1.3 Art Education in Botswana**

From an early age, young Batswana were taught skills such as weaving grass and reeds, curving wood, drawing and painting. Mannathoko (2013, p.20) stated that "elderly men in the African communities like Botswana used to pass craft skills such as wood curving to younger boys and taught them male morals through myths presentations, while elderly women passed skills such as knitting, weaving and huts designs to girls". This shows that art has always had value in the past as such, teachers need to value it and work with elderly people in their villages to tap on what they

know. Botswana and neighboring countries are renowned for bushmen paintings which were made on rock and some of the paintings date as far back as 5 000 years ago (Geddel, 2017). Art has cultural foundations and apart from rock paintings, the people of Southern Africa also made baskets mostly using reeds and artifacts from wood.

Mwamwenda (2014) reported that ECE in Botswana can be traced back to the 1960s and was intended for mothers in towns who worked full-time and therefore had to have someone taking care of their children in their absence. Bar-On (2004)'s study that examined Sub Saharan Africa's (SSA) ECE record, drawing in visits to 40 day care centres in rural and urban Botswana shows that the first ECE facilities were established shortly after independence chiefly to serve an expanding expatriate community. Maundeni (2013) and Maunganidze and Tsamaase (2014) indicated that the establishment and development of ECE followed the same trend as in other African neighboring countries. It was pioneered by NGOs and other individuals, religious organizations, prominent among them being Young Women Christian Association (YWCA).

According to Bar-On (2004) and Bose (2008), many of the centres are still privately owned while the remaining being NGOs and faith based and orphan care or institutional types. There were concerns that some centres were not adequately run because of their contents or location and the UNICEF began taking an interest in the field following its ECE involvement in East Africa (Bar-On, 2004). Consequently, in 1977, the sector's operations were officially looked into culminating in a national policy day care centres.

After years of non-involvement, Mwamwenda (2014) reported that the government came in by placing ECE under the Ministry of Local Government, Lands and Housing which then came up with a policy providing guidelines for the registration and operation of ECE. After some years,

it was recommended that ECE should be part of the Ministry of Education which has been the case to date, forming part of the primary education. As such, Mwamwenda (2014) revealed that the Ministry of Education is responsible for planning, national coordination and development of policy. By 1997, there were 291 ECE centres, 118 in urban areas and 173 in rural areas. In 2010, the figures were over 514 centres in Botswana (Mwamwenda, 2014).

#### **1.1.4 Art and Early Childhood Education in Botswana**

Although a National Policy on Education in Botswana was developed in 1977, the policy omitted pre-primary education. The RNPE (1994) remains a major policy document that guides the development of education in general and early learning in particular (Republic of Botswana, 1994). It is in adherence to the policy provisions of the RNPE that the Government of Botswana aimed at raising educational standards of its citizens at all levels to provide lifelong learning education to all (BFTU, 2007). The policy recommends for the roll out of pre-school classes which are attached to public primary schools. RNPE (1994) states that attendance in preschool has been shown to give children substantial advantages in their later education but it is acknowledged that parents and family have an important role in educating their children.

The policy further notes that the early years of learning are critical for the development of the child. In addition, a draft policy on Early Childhood Education Care and Education has been developed to address implementation strategies for the pre-primary programme (RNPE, 1994). The policy also states that the Ministry of Basic Education provides an enabling environment through pre-school grants to NGOs and Community-Based Organizations (CBOs). The Ministry also provides the coordination and professional support of the programme and stress that training of teachers continue to be offered at Lobatse Day Care at the level of Certificate.

Maunganidze and Tsamaase (2014) indicated that the government of Botswana has made significant progress in developing Early Childhood Education through establishing pre-school education in Botswana public schools known as reception classes. The reception classes are meant to close the gap between children who come to school while they have never been to a school setup (Maunganidze & Tsamaase, 2014). The initiative of reception classes also gave primary school teachers the hope of working with children who are ready for school unlike in the past where children would start at primary schools without having attended pre-schools. Before implementing reception classes it was a challenge for teachers in dealing with students who are separating with their parents for the first time. Therefore, there is hope that children who have passed through Early Childhood Education will have improved results.

Although pre-school education is considered a key component of integrated early childhood development programmes, it has the lowest participation rate among all levels of the broad education system in Botswana with only 17 percent attending some form of pre-primary school education (Maunganidze & Tsamaase, 2014). In fact, Maunganidze & Tsamaase (2014) stated that the situation is partly aggravated by government's failure to partake or at least partly sponsor education at this level. Early Childhood Education and Care (ECEC) programmes are only funded by government through the Councils at a minimal rate. In essence, pre-school education in Botswana has always been and still remains a privilege of the few who are children of the elite as the required fees are immensely varied and exorbitant for an ordinary Botswana (Bose, 2008).

**Table 1: Number of pre-primary school teachers by qualification, school ownership and Sex-2014**

| 2013 Pre-Primary Teachers |           |             |             |           |             |             | 2014 Pre-Primary Teachers |             |             |           |             |             |
|---------------------------|-----------|-------------|-------------|-----------|-------------|-------------|---------------------------|-------------|-------------|-----------|-------------|-------------|
| Trained                   |           |             | Untrained   |           |             |             | Trained                   |             |             | Untrained |             |             |
| Ownership                 | Male      | Female      | Total       | Male      | Female      | Total       | Male                      | Female      | Total       | Male      | Female      | Total       |
| Council                   | -         | 36          | 36          | 1         | 9           | 10          | -                         | 51          | 51          | -         | 11          | 11          |
| Community                 | 17        | 1022        | 1039        | 13        | 850         | 863         | 3                         | 68          | 71          | 4         | 86          | 90          |
| Church                    | 1         | 98          | 99          | 2         | 84          | 86          | 2                         | 115         | 117         | 1         | 88          | 89          |
| Private                   | 4         | 86          | 90          | 1         | 80          | 81          | 16                        | 1162        | 1178        | 17        | 1037        | 1054        |
| NGO                       | 1         | 103         | 104         | -         | 76          | 76          | 3                         | 90          | 93          | 5         | 83          | 88          |
| Institutional             | -         | 4           | 4           | 1         | 3           | 4           | -                         | 7           | 7           | 1         | 1           | 2           |
| Other                     | 3         | -           | 3           | -         | 2           | 2           | -                         | 2           | 2           | -         | 5           | 5           |
| Government                | -         | -           | 0           | -         | -           | -           | 5                         | 66          | 71          | -         | 5           | 5           |
| <b>Total</b>              | <b>26</b> | <b>1349</b> | <b>1375</b> | <b>18</b> | <b>1104</b> | <b>1122</b> | <b>29</b>                 | <b>1561</b> | <b>1590</b> | <b>28</b> | <b>1316</b> | <b>1344</b> |

**Source: Republic of Botswana (2016a, p. 12).**

The results from table 1 show that majority of the teachers are females. It further shows that there were 44 male and 2 453 female pre-primary teachers in 2013 compared to 57 male and 2 905 female teachers in 2014. Of all teachers in 2014, 1 590 were trained constituting 54.2 per cent while 45.8 per cent (1 344 teachers) were untrained.

Bose (2008; 2010) observed an acute shortage of qualified and trained personnel in public centres and this problem was exacerbated by the absence of a prescribed curriculum. However, a lot of changes occurred since then and the sector has witnessed phenomenal growth. Among the changes, the government has started enrolling pre-primary school students in primary schools known as reception classes as well as offering and sponsoring Early Childhood Education courses in public institutions such as the Botswana Open University (BOU) (Maunganidze & Tsamaase, 2014).

Children should be given space to develop their artistic talents and one of the best and appropriate environments to lay the foundation is in an early childhood setting (Republic of Botswana, 2015b). Early Childhood Education is vital for every growing child in this era where we live in a competitive global village (Republic of Botswana, 2015b). Attendance in pre-school education has shown to give children a great chance to be advantaged in their later education life as a whole. Although pre-schools offers great benefits to children, in Botswana many children are missing in pre-schools and this place them at disadvantage. The non-attendance of pre-schools by many children in Botswana is because public-preschools are at their infancy stage as the service is largely offered by individuals and Non-Governmental Organizations making it difficult for low paid and unemployed parents to enroll their children (Bose, 2010; Maundeni, 2013; Maunganidze & Tsamaase, 2014). Another reason for not taking children to pre-school is that Botswana citizens have always believed that mothers should take care of their children as it is their role, this made even parents who could afford ECEC to be reluctant to send their children to ECE centres. The few children who accessed ECE were those from affluent families, those from middle class and low classes were not able to afford it, thus denying young children a benefit that will affect their education in later stages (Maundeni, 2013).

Table 2 below shows the number of pre-schools across all districts in Botswana. The table shows that cities and towns (urban) have many pre-schools as compared to villages (rural).

**Table. 2: Number of pre-primary schools by district and terms of operation-2014**

| <i>District</i>        | <i>Half-day</i> | <i>Full-day</i> | <i>Total</i> |
|------------------------|-----------------|-----------------|--------------|
| <i>Gaborone</i>        | 13              | 81              | 94           |
| <i>Francistown</i>     | 6               | 50              | 56           |
| <i>Lobatse</i>         | 4               | 14              | 18           |
| <i>Selibe-Phikwe</i>   | 4               | 21              | 25           |
| <i>Orapa</i>           | 1               | 2               | 3            |
| <i>Jwaneng</i>         | 1               | 12              | 13           |
| <i>Sowa</i>            | 1               | 2               | 3            |
| <i>Southern</i>        | 7               | 35              | 42           |
| <i>Borolong</i>        | 3               | 13              | 16           |
| <i>South East</i>      | 3               | 34              | 37           |
| <i>Kweneng</i>         | 3               | 75              | 78           |
| <i>Kgatleng</i>        | 4               | 30              | 34           |
| <i>Serowe/Palapye</i>  | 2               | 38              | 40           |
| <i>Mahalapye</i>       | 3               | 25              | 28           |
| <i>Bobirwa</i>         | -               | 12              | 12           |
| <i>Boteti</i>          | -               | 4               | 4            |
| <i>Tutume</i>          | 4               | 25              | 29           |
| <i>North East</i>      | 6               | 22              | 28           |
| <i>Maun East</i>       | 5               | 27              | 32           |
| <i>Maun West</i>       | 2               | 9               | 11           |
| <i>Chobe</i>           | 3               | 5               | 8            |
| <i>Gantsi</i>          | 1               | 13              | 14           |
| <i>Kgalagadi South</i> | -               | 4               | 4            |
| <i>Kgalagadi North</i> | 4               | 12              | 16           |
| <b><i>Total</i></b>    | <b>80</b>       | <b>565</b>      | <b>645</b>   |

Source: Republic of Botswana (2016a, p.12).

In Botswana the need for the provision of Early Childhood Education is even more compelling for both child development practitioners and academics given the reported increase in early pregnancies, single parenthood and households exacerbated by HIV-AIDS and concomitant lack of appreciation and understanding of the children's early education need (Maunganidze & Tsamaase, 2014). The first ECE facilities in Botswana were established shortly after the country's independence chiefly to serve the expatriate community, since then ECE has had low priority in government budgeting compared to other countries. The Republic of Botswana (2016b) noted that ECE is vital for every growing child in this era which we live as we live in a competitive global village. Despite the enactment of new policies, programmes and strategies in improving ECE, art in early education remains an illusion. These documents omits the mention of art as important activity in ECE while the focus is to increase access of young children to ECE.

### **1.1.5 Policy Directions in Early Childhood Education in Botswana**

There are policies that have informed decision making in Early Childhood Education. In Botswana, women in various parts of the country gathered children in their homes for custodial care while at the same time they taught them various activities that stimulated their development (Maundeni, 2013). The women were providing the service without pay. Complementing these efforts by women were various forms of day care centers, which were operated by voluntary organizations such as churches, the Red Cross and private individuals. With the passage of time, concern was raised that some of the schemes were not adequately run and this lead to the first National Day Care Centre Policy (NDCP) in 1980. The NDCP (1980) was based on the Montessori Method of teaching young children, which is an international recognized method of teaching young children (McArdle & Piscitelli, 2002). Due to many changes in Botswana society, the Day Care Centre Policy of 1980 proved to be outdated as it ran short of addressing issues such

as standards and regulations, training of teachers, curriculum development and support of different types of programs such as children under the age of two years and community involvement or participation and this culminated into the development of Early Childhood Care and Education Policy (ECCE) of 2001 (Maundeni, 2013).

The government further developed the Pre-primary Curriculum Framework as a supporting document to the ECCE policy (Republic of Botswana, 2015a). The Pre-primary School Curriculum Framework is currently used in government pre-schools as the main guide. However, it does not provide a clear reflection of art as a subject in its own right but only suggests that art be incorporated in other subjects (Republic of Botswana, 2013). It is anticipated that the teachers offering ECE in public schools include art to help children communicate their views through it. The importance of art education in ECE curriculum cannot be underestimated as art plays a key role in improving young children's development. Artwork in young children starts in the early stages of a child life. When a child scribbles, paints and makes simple drawings, their fine motor skills, imagination and creativity are developed. They also learn other concepts from other subjects such as colours and numbers (Essa, 2011).

Despite the importance of art education in the development of a child, many children are missing from schools. The UN is concerned that poverty, armed conflict and other emergencies keep many children around the world out of school, therefore, formulated the Sustainable Development Goal (SDG) number four, which encourages the member states to ensure inclusive and equitable quality education and promote life-long learning opportunities for all (Republic of Botswana, 2017). In line with this goal, the Botswana government through the Vision 2036 also formulated goal number two which encourages human and social development through opening up access to quality education as a way of realizing the UN SDG goal number four (Republic of

Botswana, 2016b). This is possible through compulsory education for all children but they will only progress having satisfied the minimum requirements (Republic of Botswana, 2016b). It is against this backdrop that the policy on Early Childhood Education care and education is currently under review to address implementation strategies for the pre-primary programme (Republic of Botswana, 2017).

In addition to the policies and the curriculum framework, Botswana government through the Ministry of Basic Education developed an Education and Training Sector Strategic Plan (ETSSP) which is a five year strategy to improve education in Botswana. ETSSP commenced in 2015 and is expected to end in 2020 and possibly beyond (Republic of Botswana 2015a). Its development is divided into four phases. The ultimate goal of ETSSP is to transform Botswana from a resource based to a skill based economy leveraging on an aligned competitive education (Republic of Botswana 2015a). This strategy is informed by a number of public policies such as the RNPE which are geared towards driving the national development agenda with special reference to human resource development.

#### **1.1.6 Early Childhood Education and art education in Africa**

Mwamwenda (2014) conducted a study in Africa that examined Early Childhood Education (ECE) in the African Union (AU) countries on the basis of expansion, enrollment, teachers, rural, and gender distribution. Questionnaires were distributed to participants for collecting data for the study. Mwamwenda's (2014) findings showed that the history of Early Childhood Education in Africa can be traced back as early as the 19<sup>th</sup> century in Ethiopia followed by others such as in Kenya in 1942, Zambia in 1957, Lesotho in 1970, Tanzania in 1980 while in other countries such as Zimbabwe, Nigeria and Namibia it was developed in the late 90s.

According to Admas (2016), ECE in Ethiopia started early for French children followed by English and German schools intended for affluent families in Addis Ababa.

The findings showed that the turning point for ECE in Ethiopia started in 1981 with the establishment of the Ethiopian Children Commission (ECC) whose primary function was to care and educate Ethiopian children. This resulted in policy development, activity involving awareness, workshops and seminars followed by the inclusion of ECE into the educational policy. Mwamwenda (2014) observed that a curriculum was developed and teacher education for ECE was introduced with relevant support from the United Nations Children's Emergency Fund (UNICEF). By 1990s, the government's role was confined to teachers training, curriculum development, and monitoring and improving quality education. In Zambia, ECE commenced in 1957 when the law was passed in support of Early Childhood Education; stressing its importance in the development of a child, the emphasis being placed on registration and regulation of ECE schools (Ndhlovu, Mtonga, Serenje-Chipindi & Muzata, 2016). From 1977 to 1992, an education policy recognized ECE as part of the education system though there was no guarantee that ECE would be accessible to all eligible children.

In Lesotho, ECE was started by women organizations known as the Lesotho National Council for Women (LNCW) and the Lesotho Day Care and Community Centre (LDCC) (Mwamwenda, 2014). In the course of providing such useful service, they were of the view that to do the programme justice, there was need for the government's involvement in ECE, and this led to the government to establish ECE under the Ministry of Education funded by Bernard Van Leer Foundation, a Netherlands based organization (Mwamwenda, 2014).

The development of ECE curriculum in African countries focused on six areas. One of the six areas of learning curriculum is creative development. According to a guidance produced by the Qualifications and Curriculum Authority (2000) other areas include developing children's knowledge and understanding in art, music, dance, role play and imaginative play, and helping them to make connections between areas of learning. Early childhood may be considered to be a crucial time for the development of creativity. Children who are exposed to beauty experiences will develop the skill to appreciate things that are taught to them in their early childhood settings. This development will ultimately lead to the appreciation and valuing of good design in their adulthood. At the same time the concept developments they acquire during the process enable them to have the ability to problem solving that involves thinking and imagining (Kindler, 2010).

As highlighted in Jalongo and Stamp in Mahgoub (2015), art education in Early Childhood Education is to create opportunities to experience and promote interest so as to learn to appreciate and develop the skill to evaluate art forms. Art helps people to understand other cultures as examples have evidently shown that some of the information and knowledge we acquire about people from the past centuries were not recorded in the form of written words but in the form of drawing (National Art Education Association, 2015). Empirical evidences corroborate the fact that art is a rich source of understanding culture as it reveals the human activities most of the time but the role of art in Early Childhood Education is neglected in Botswana.

Furthermore, Cevirgen, Aktas and Kot (2018) highlighted that art allows young children to enjoy success as it develops children's skills in hand and eye coordination, persistent, patience and good working habits. It is found that learning in other domains also take place through art activities (Kindler, 2010). Through art education, children acquire knowledge, understanding and skills that help them in the development of physical, intellectual, emotional and social domains.

Finally, art influences children's learning as well as what educators can do to enhance their learning (Cevirgen et al., 2018). Bredekamp and Copple (2009) argued that by understanding why art is important for young children, teachers will find it easier and willing to see new things and adapt to changes. Bredekamp and Copple (2009) further pointed out that seeing new things allows improvement in practices through constant exploration. However, that does not mean that the existing thinking or concepts are completely removed but rather it helps to make those thinking concepts better.

The forgoing discussion has highlighted that there is a relationship between art and education and Early Childhood Education. The way teachers view art and children is important as it influences and determines how they will teach children art. The way teachers perceive art and children affect the teaching of art. Thus, teaching art is affected by certain circumstances such as how teachers perceive art and children and this also determines their teaching methods in art.

## **1.2 Statement of the problem**

The role of art in Early Childhood Education in Botswana is not recognized. Art is a marginalized subject and it is not recognized as a core subject and yet it has a lot of potential in terms of child development because it has a greater scope to be taught through child centred approaches when compared to core subjects like mathematics (Nompula, 2013). ECE has been run by foreigners as well as private organizations who charge exorbitant fees (Bose, 2008 & Maunganidze & Tsamaase, 2014). This resulted in many children from poor families and rural communities failing to access Early Childhood Education where they could learn and develop their artistic skills. This impacted negatively on children's development as children could not benefit from ECE in learning and doing art which is known to be good at developing motor skills and

cognitive skills as well as stimulate other parts of the children's development, while many children could also make a living out of art.

Jackman (2012) asserted that art was fundamental to the growth of a young child and it contributed to the whole development of a child. Thus art should be a vehicle for teaching young children, more especially those in ECE as they are growing. Isbell and Raines (2013) advised that art must be carefully designed in the early years to help children find meaning in the world they live in. Using art as a vehicle for teaching young children is like giving children an opportunity to enjoy learning. As a result, the ECE curriculum should include activities rich in art to make schooling enjoyable and meaningful as well as prepare children for formal education (Day & Hurwitz, 2012). The nagging problem at hand therefore, is whether teachers in public pre-schools understand the role played by art in teaching young children to prepare them for formal school readiness.

### **1.3 The purpose of study**

The purpose of this study is as follows;

1.3.1 To explore the role of art in Early Childhood Education.

1.3.3 To find out from teachers how they use art in early childhood classes.

1.3.3 To identify the challenges (if any) faced by teachers when teaching Early Childhood Education through art.

1.3.4 To suggest possible ways of addressing the challenges (if any) in the teaching of Early Childhood Education using art.

## **1.4 Research questions**

The study is guided by the research questions as follows;

1. What is the role of art in Early Childhood Education?
2. What techniques do teachers use in Early Childhood Education classes?
3. What challenges do teachers experience when teaching ECE using art?
4. What suggestions can be provided for addressing the challenges experienced by teachers in ECE instruction using art?

## **1.5 Justification for the study**

There is shortage of literature on the field of Early Childhood Education in Botswana. Bose (2008; 2010), Bar-On (2014), and Maunganidze and Tsamaase (2014) are among few of the researchers who have conducted some studies on Early Childhood Education. Most of the available literature on the field of Early Childhood Education focus on the challenges facing Early Childhood Education, as well as challenges faced by teachers and pre-schools in the implementation of ECE in the country. Some of the literature focuses on the importance of Early Childhood Education. The role of art in Early Childhood Education seems to be neglected hence the need to conduct this study. Furthermore, most of the available literature is dated as it ranges from 2004 to 2013. Thus, this study is important considering that art education is necessary for the development of the child holistically; motor and cognitive skills.

The Revised National Policy on Education (RNPE) (1994) acts as a guide in programme activities of the Ministry of Basic Education in terms of curriculum reform and ongoing improvements in the education system since National Development Plan 8 (NDP 8). Some of the recommendations of the RNPE were (a) achievement of access to ten years basic education and

(b) review of the basic education curriculum and development of core instructional support material (BFTU, 2007). The policy encourages access to basic education but does not specifically address the issue of art subject in the curriculum in pre-primary education although the need to develop a child from a very young age. As a result, the draft policy on Early Childhood Care and Education was developed in 2001 to address the implementation strategies for the pre-primary programme. This policy also fails to mention art in Early Childhood Education. Sustainable Development Goal number four states that “ensure inclusive and equitable quality education and promote lifelong learning opportunities for all” (United Nations, 2015, p.3). The goal has ten targets and the second target specifically deals with ECE and states that “by 2030, ensure that all girls and boys have access to quality early childhood development, care and pre-primary education so that they are ready for primary education (UN, 2015, p.4). The SDG goal also fail to mention the role art it plays in the development of a child in ECE.

### **1.6 Significance of the study**

This study is believed to be significant as it is expected to provide insights on the role of art education in ECE. It is anticipated that parents, policy makers, curriculum developers and pupils will benefit from this study. It is hoped that the study will offer parents information that could make them understand the impact of art in the development of a child in order for them to enroll their children in pre-primary schools where art is expected to be fully taught more than other subjects hence helping young children to develop their motor and cognitive skills. Policy makers and curriculum developers are expected to gain knowledge which could be taken into account when reviewing education policies, curriculum frameworks for ECE and what ECE curriculum must entail in relation to art and art teaching perspectives and strategies.

ECE is a new component in the public schools, therefore, the findings of the study are expected to help pre-school teachers to improve the teaching of ECE programmes using art. The findings of the study are also expected to help pre-school teachers' trainers and teachers to align their teaching or training in ECE using art and to improve teachers' awareness on the role of art in young children in order to fully engage children in art activities in pre-schools. Furthermore, teachers in preschools are expected to benefit by identifying their shortcomings (if any) and try to bridge such gaps in the teaching and learning of ECE. The study is also expected to provide information that could enable the Ministry of Basic Education (MoBE) to realize that art can be used to enrich the ECE curriculum and incorporate it in the curriculum as a core subject.

### **1.7 Limitations of study**

Every study has external factors that may hinder the study which are beyond the researchers' control. Price and Murnan (2004) stated that the limitations of every study should be mentioned because they may have an influence on the results. For this study, it is anticipated that since the researcher is on part time studies while working, time could be limited for the research to be executed. Another factor that may be a hindrance to the study could be finances as the researcher is self-sponsored and will have to travel from her work place to different places to collect data. The frequent travels to Kgomodiatshaba School where the researcher is working at, the University of Botswana where she is a student and the research field (Kgatleng region) for data collection is likely to impact on the time frame of the study because of many commitments. This is likely to overwhelm the researcher because of the limited resources at her disposal such as finance and transport as the researcher is self-sponsored, as well as fatigue.

In addition, the research may incur limitations as a result of the research methods used. The researcher uses observation and in-depth interviews as research methods of data collection which are qualitative methods. Observations are prone to Hawthorne effect, that is, subjects may change their behavior due to the presence of the researcher especially the teacher in order to paint a picture that the teacher would want the researcher to see (Kawulich, 2012). Furthermore, the researcher could also observe situations that she is not interested on and this could take up much of her time. The use of qualitative research methods are expensive and take long to complete. Furthermore, the qualitative approach design is prone to bias because of the subjective meanings of phenomena.

In-depth interviews are time intensive. Thus, it takes time to conduct interviews as it involves a series of processes starting with requests to conduct interviews from the management of schools to finally finding a suitable time to actually conduct interviews (Neuman, 2011). Interviews are prone to bias as respondents could provide information that is not truthful to the researcher in order to impress her or mislead, thereby compromising the quality of the study.

### **1.8 Delimitation of study**

Delimitations are those characteristics that limit the scope and define the boundaries of the study. The delimitations are under the researcher's control (Price & Murnan, 2004). This study will be confined to schools in the Kgatleng Region because it is within the researcher's proximity and it is not very broad as compared to other regions. The results of this study cannot be generalized to the whole population because the schools are unique and the challenges they encounter may be confined to the location and uniqueness of the schools and the region. This study is a qualitative study and uses a small sample which generalization may not paint a true picture about the findings of the study. As noted by Polit and Beck (2010), in qualitative research, the goal

is to provide rich and contextualized understanding of human experience through the intensive study of particular cases.

## **1.9 Theoretical framework**

This study is informed by the theory of multiple intelligences by Howard Gardner. This theory is chosen because it stresses the need for teachers to observe and understand how each child learns. Children in preschools learn through the use of art and should be afforded the chance to engage in art activities for them to be free to learn. This theory of multiple intelligences is applicable to this study because art as a subject touch on visual-spatial intelligence, musical intelligence and bodily kinaesthetic intelligence. This theory is applicable because children have multiple intelligences and the researcher believes that if children's artistic intelligences are nurtured at the earliest stages of their life especially through art in ECE programmes they can develop into good artists than nurturing other intelligences which children may have lower proportions and weakening artistic intelligence. This would help students in future when they realize that the other nurtured intelligences are not as good as their artistic intelligences as they would fall back on their artistic intelligence they developed in ECE through art and make a positive future for themselves in art.

Gardner (1993) defined intelligence as “the capacity to solve problems or to fashion products that are valued in one or more cultural setting” (p. 35). Traditionally, in the fields of education, and the cognitive science, “intelligence has been regarded as a uniform cognitive capacity that people are born with” (Gardner, 1983, p.7). However, in this theory of multiple intelligences, Gardner (1993) challenged traditional beliefs by acknowledging that people have different cognitive strengths as well as different cognitive styles. He suggested that the notion of

intelligence based on the IQ test is far too limited and proposed a number of intelligences to account for a broader range of human potential.

Gardner (1993) stated that each individual possesses 'nine' intelligences; logical-mathematical intelligence (the capacity to analyze problems logically and scientifically); linguistic intelligence (sensitivity to the spoken and written word and the ability to master language); visual-spatial intelligence (forming mental models of a spatial world, creating mental imagery, re-creating visual experiences and producing graphical likeness of spatial information); musical intelligence (skill in the performance, composition and appreciation of music); bodily kinaesthetic intelligence (working skillfully with objects, controlling fine and gross motor movements, using the body in highly differentiated and skilled ways for expressive and goal-directed purposes); personal intelligence (the capacity for understanding oneself and a talent for understanding and relating to other people); naturalistic intelligence (sensing patterns in and making connections to elements of nature, such as species or the environment); and existential intelligence (the proclivity to pose and ponder questions about life, death, and ultimate realities).

Lau (2006) stated that Gardner believed that all human beings have multiple intelligences in varying proportions and to different extents, and claims that all intelligences can be nurtured and strengthened, or ignored and weakened. If teachers in preschool settings can capitalize on the use of art when teaching young children then children's holistic development will be ensured. Gardner (1983) claimed that each of these intelligences has its own pattern of development and brain activity. He argued that biologically, children's learning is an outcome that results in synaptic connections in different areas of the brain. In testing his theory, Lau (2006) revealed that children showed distinctive styles of cognitive. He asserts that some children approach the world through the use of language, whereas others centered on spatial aspects, social relationships, or other

dimensions. Gardner (1993) claimed that a focus on particular intelligence is apparent in children's preferences for certain types of learning experiences, for instance, some children enjoy creating musical compositions but may not be very good at telling stories. Teachers can assist young children to make connections across the intelligences through particular types of learning experiences by active use of art.

### **1.10 Summary**

This chapter provided an introduction to the study. This study intended to investigate the role of art in ECE in Kgatleng region primary schools in Botswana. The study also provided a background information to the study. Research in ECE and art education is more developed in western countries such as Australia, New Zealand, Japan, and America (Wong, 2007) than in African countries as many countries in Africa are lagging behind in the development of ECE. This chapter provided an overview of Botswana's education system. Botswana's basic education system comprise of pre-primary, primary and junior secondary education (BFTU, 2007). The chapter provided history of education in Botswana. In pre-colonial Botswana, education was largely informal through initiation schools (Denbow and Thebe, 2006). In post-independence, Botswana adopted the western form of education system which has grown in leaps and bounds (Pheko, 2010).

The chapter provided a background on Early Childhood Education and art education in Africa. Many African countries inherited ECE from western countries in the 19<sup>th</sup> century as many centres were run by private companies especially expatriates, churches, NGOs, and therefore, many African children were excluded from ECE due to unaffordable prices (Mwamwenda, 2014). The chapter provided that art education in Botswana was evident from time immemorial as elderly

men in communities passed craft skills such as wood carving to younger boys while women passed skills such as weaving to girls (Mannathoko, 2013). The chapter provided that early childhood learning is critical for the development of the child hence the need to have art in ECE and to increase access to ECE for many children. As a result, the government introduced reception classes in public primary schools in order to increase access to ECE. The chapter provided information on policies guiding ECE in Botswana. Although there are many policies that inform decision making in ECE such as the RNPE and the Draft policy on Early Childhood Care and Education (Republic of Botswana, 2015), all policies are silent on the role of art education in ECE except concerning themselves with access to ECE while the closest is the pre-primary school curriculum framework which only suggests that art should be incorporated in other subjects (Republic of Botswana, 2013).

The chapter provided the statement of the problem. Thus, art is marginalized in basic education despite its potential in terms of child development (Nompula, 2013). The chapter provided the purpose of the study, which is to explore the role of art in Early Childhood Education; to find out from teachers how they use art in early childhood classes; to identify the challenges (if any) faced by teachers when teaching Early Childhood Education through art; and to suggest possible ways of addressing the challenges (if any) in the teaching of Early Childhood Education using art. The chapter provided the justification for the study. There is not enough literature on ECE in Botswana while there is no literature on the role of art education in ECE. The available literature focuses mainly on the challenges of ECE neglecting the role of art in ECE. The chapter provided the significance of the study. This study is expected to provide insights on the role of art in young children in order to provide awareness to pre-school teachers' trainers, teachers, policy

makers and curriculum developers to develop policies, curriculum and to train teachers in line with the needs of young children.

The chapter provided some limitations, which include biasness due to the use of observations and in-depth interviews which might affect the results of the study. The chapter provided delimitations of the study. The results of the study may not be generalizable to other regions or schools. The chapter provided that this study would be informed by the theory of multiple intelligences of Howard Gardner who stated that young children learn through the use of art and should be accorded the chance to engage in art activities, for them to be free to learn. The theory espouses that all children are born with multiple intelligences, therefore, it depends on which ones are cultivated. Borrowing from Pablo Picasso “all children are artists. The problem is how to remain an artist once he grows up” (Gelonch-Viladegut, 2011, p.31).

In conclusion this study is divided into three chapters of which chapter one focuses on the background, chapter two on literature review and chapter three on research methodology. For research methodology, the study adopts the qualitative approach using a case study of Kgatleng region. It also adopts the interpretive paradigm. Two research methods of classroom observation and in-depth method are used for data collection.

## **Chapter 2: Literature Review**

### **2.0 Introduction**

This chapter reviews literature in relation to art education in Early Childhood Education. The chapter looks at the international perspective, the regional context and the Botswana context.

The chapter focuses on the role of art in Early Childhood Education, the role of teachers in ECE, art activities and perspectives in ECE.

## **2.1 The International Perspective**

There is extensive literature on art education in Early Childhood Education in the developed world. Early Childhood Education on art has been documented globally by many researchers such as Gunn (2000), Garvis (2012), Novakovic (2015), Lindsay (2016) and Yazici (2017). Previous studies in art education show that a lot of literature in art education and Early Childhood Education is mostly concentrated in New Zealand where art in Early Childhood Education is widely developed and established (Garvis, 2012 & Lindsay, 2016). This section focuses on the role of art education in Early Childhood Education, the role of teachers in Early Childhood Education, art activities and perspectives in Early Childhood Education.

### **2.1.1 The role of Art Education in Early Childhood Education**

Garvis (2012) conducted a study that explored current practice in kindergartens and preparatory classrooms in Queensland, Australia and also explored early childhood teacher beliefs about the philosophy and valuing of art education using interpretive qualitative design. In his study, he used field notes as well as observations in four different sites in Queensland. Garvis (2012) found that art education helps to meet the various learning styles of all children and should be something that is embedded in daily practice not something one does if time permits. But in Botswana schools, art is done if time permits as it is not regarded as a core subject or an important subject. This could be due to lack of knowledge on the role of art. The findings by Garvis (2012) showed that art is valuable in allowing children multiple ways of understanding and presenting their world. Almost two thirds of preschool teachers in Croatian kindergartens consider that, for

imaginative and inherent art interpretation, significance lies in diverse experiences which activate multiple children's perceptions and to which they respond according to their individual inclinations and possibilities (Novakovic, 2015).

Novakovic (2015) examined preschool teachers' attitudes on the role of the art activities and the frequency of some didactic approaches to art activities implementation. This study collected information from 17 kindergartens in Croatia using questionnaires. It was found that although almost all preschool teachers consider that individual research, experimenting, thinking, and problem solving through one's own experiences in play, is a way children develop different abilities, majority of the preschool teachers think that their role in art activities is to teach a child how to draw, paint and shape in space. However, this study revealed that an insignificant number of preschool teachers do not understand that children learn on the basics of their own experiences. Novakovic (2015) stressed that not appreciating children's explanation of the created art work on the part of the preschool teacher, and imposing inappropriate samples pose underestimation of children's art abilities and negatively influence the child's creative expression development.

Lindsay (2016) in her study that examined the visual art beliefs and pedagogy, and found that preschool teachers expressed views about the importance of joy in the experience of making art, the pleasure in the process, the creative outlet and the freedom of exploration where there are no wrong answers. Lindsay's (2016) study was qualitative in nature and examined four Australian early childhood centres with interviews with preschool educators, environmental audits and analysis of pedagogical documentation about visual art. In another study carried out by Yazici (2017) in the District of Kecioren in Ankara, the findings of the study showed that the art program significantly improved the social skills in all domains as well as overall scores. The study was carried out to determine the effect of art program education on the social skills of preschool

children at the age of 61 to 72 months attending kindergartens using experimental designs of pre-test and post-test.

In addition, Yazici (2017) found that visual arts is a social activity which aims to improve imagination and intellectual skills. The study also revealed that art makes pupils attain a great many values such as learning visual language, formation of art taste, the skill to think originally as a different way of communication, improve physical development, accelerate mental development, improve imagination, start to build up culture and form self-confidence. Yazici's (2017) findings further revealed that kinesthetic art supports and improves the physical and cognitive developments of children as children discuss and listen to the views of their own and others' dances.

### **2.1.2 The role of teachers in Early Childhood Education**

Teachers play an important role in art education and the development of the child in education. Gunn (2000) conducted a study in New Zealand investigating the teachers' beliefs and practices in relation to visual art education in early childhood centres. He used questionnaires to gather information from participants in childhood centres. Gunn (2000) reported that young learners must be accorded the freewill to fully express themselves with minimal adult direction as it provides an opportunity for creative expression and creativity. Gunn (2000)'s findings showed that teachers in art are given instructions that they do not become involved in children's artistic endeavors. Garvis (2012) shared the same sentiment that teachers' role is to guide than to teach. Moreover, Garvis' (2012) findings indicated that the teachers' role is to support creativity through facilitating suitable learning environments that promote art, teaching the skills associated with different art forms and helping children transfer their skills to other learning areas. Despite the role

of teachers being guides, in reality, many teachers tend to impose their ideas on young learners and this may result in children losing interest in art as they want to do something they enjoy.

Novakovic (2015)'s findings corroborate with both Gunn (2000) and Garvis (2012) in that the task of every preschool teacher is to encourage and stimulate children's complete development, their abilities, aspirations and interests. Gunn (2000)'s findings resonates with Lowenfeld, who is one of the renowned writers and researcher on art education, who told teachers in 1947 that the desired outcome of visual art education was "creative and mental growth" therefore, teachers were guided by the central notion that "any application of an external standard, whether technique or form, immediately induces inhibitions and frustrates the whole aim." Therefore, Gunn (2000) alluded to Lowenfeld (1947)'s idea of a teacher being a guide, as the teacher is responsible for providing experiences and conducive environment and a watcher of children's innate creative expression.

Gunn's (2000) findings indicated that the direction at which teachers were guided by such theory of the time was towards non-intervention. Gunn's (2000) findings also reveal that teachers need to continue to focus their energy on presenting visual art programme areas for children and leaving them to experiment, explore and express without assisting, provoking, scaffolding children's visual art experiences. Gunn (2000) argued that there is need to accept that children's artistic development takes care of itself when in other domains of children's development teachers play an active role planning learning experiences to challenge children's competence. That's is, children are genuine artists as their art activities springs mostly from their experiences, which none of which comes as a rehearsal of experience. According to Gunn (2000), the discipline based idea of children's right to education in and about art education though the sub-disciplines did not receive acceptance from participants. However, Gunn (2000)'s findings showed that children

require the ability to talk about, reflect upon, and produce art if they are thought to be using art as a tool for communication as cognitive theory would suggest.

Through careful scaffolding and appropriate intervention, early childhood teachers are in a position to assist children to work at the edge of their competence in this domain of their development. Thus teachers are encouraged to help pupils to do art rather than taking the role of “really teaching art.” Lindsay’s (2016) study in examining early childhood centres and analyzing pedagogical documentation about visual art found that pre-school teachers expressed the belief that children’s development is best fostered when preschool teachers provide a range of art materials, along with emotional support, while refraining from any intervention in children’s art making process. One of the pre-school participants interviewed despite previous training and some expertise in visual art techniques adamantly refused to model, guide or participate with children in the art-making process stating that the worst thing he could do as an educator, the way that he could most fail the children is by him drawing something and them seeing how he draws something as a standard. The aforementioned pre-school teacher stated that there was no need and argued that it is completely superfluous and potentially damaging, and this is in contradiction to how children develop knowledge and skills in other learning domains through observation.

Novakovic’s (2015) study on examining preschool teachers’ attitudes about the role of activities in Croatia contended that professionally trained workers such as teachers influence the realization of quality in the early and preschool education. He observed that for the quality of art pedagogic work alongside their psychological and pedagogical competencies, preschool teachers need the knowledge of the art profession. Visual literacy knowledge of art theory and visual art are the basis for understanding children’s artistic growth, art-creative process, and appropriate methodological planning of art activities (Novakovic, 2015). The findings showed that most of

preschool teachers who were interviewed possess good knowledge of art language basis, art areas and techniques, and also of the art history basics. Teachers in Croatian kindergartens recognize the importance of shaping a motivating environment and the offerings of necessary materials and tools in accordance with children's interests and needs (Novakovic, 2015). In Botswana, the majority of pre-school teachers are not trained in ECE (Maundeni, 2013; Maunganidze & Tsamaase, 2014). Thus teachers are not only lack ECE knowledge but also lack art skills that can help young children express themselves freely. Novakovich's (2015) study is helpful to as it informs this study that not only is ECE knowledge important when dealing with young children but also, teachers in pre-schools must poses art skills as this would assist in the development of art based pre-schools curriculum.

### **2.1.3 Art activities and perspectives in Early Childhood Education**

This section discusses literature on the composition of art activities in Early Childhood Education classrooms. Garvis' (2012) study showed that kindergarten curriculum feature art heavily alongside the play-based curriculum. The findings indicated that many art activities were part of the day routine in kindergarten classrooms which include music as introductory and transitions from one activity to another, dramatic play and creating objects with craft were encouraged, while children also investigated the mixing of colours, painting, clay and playdough and were continually emerged in sensory-based activities. According to Garvis (2012), in art, children were learning about different shapes and textures. Gunn (2000)'s findings provides a model of art education for young childhood education in Early Childhood Education. The Discipline Based Art Education (DBAE) model provides a good picture of what early childhood visual art programmes potentially could be comprised (Gunn, 2000). The DBAE is an approach to instruction and learning in art that derives content from four foundational disciplines that

contribute to the creation, understanding and appreciation of art (Mannathoko, 2016). The approach encompasses disciplines of art production, art criticism, aesthetics and art history (The Arts Council, 2013). Mannathoko (2016) argued that the framework has the greatest aim of teaching art in its social, cultural and historical context and combines practical work with theoretical enhancement of in-depth knowledge of visual arts among art students.

Therefore, visual art programmes built upon the notion of extending children's artistic development in the domain are the potential for early childhood centre programmes. If children are skilled in the tools of the discipline they are able to use these to communicate their understandings of the world, their perspectives on their lives, and their responses to the environment. Gunn (2000) noted that teachers of young children need to believe that this is possible and that they are skilled partners in children's learning experiences can support this process. However, Garvis' (2012) findings showed that kindergarten teachers cautioned parents against taking their children into preparatory classrooms that do not embrace art in learning. In a play-based curriculum, it is easier to embed art practices throughout the day with the children being able to guide the decision-making and amount of engagement they have.

Garvis (2012) stated that some participants feared that preparatory classrooms will not keep their intended play-base and will inhibit the opportunities for rich engagement with as many of the art as there should be. However, Garvis (2012) discovered that in preparatory classrooms, art did not feature as an important area of learning for children as in most cases, students studied literacy and numeracy and little time was devoted to engaging children in art. The findings also show evidence that teachers' art practice was shaped by their teaching philosophy, the way they viewed child development. Children's learning and their own teaching (Garvis, 2012). Kindergarten

teachers saw art as an important area of development for young children. Art was considered just as important as literacy and numeracy and needed to be taught as an individual subject.

Kocer (2012) argued that in pre-schools, children are given an opportunity to visit museums where they meet artists and other museum staff who would talk about the art works in the organization. From the visits, children are expected to make their own art work and would be given an opportunity to express themselves by talking about the product that they have created. Kocer (2012) emphasized that children's talking about what they create in art activities promotes language development as well as express emotions. For Lindsay (2016), her findings indicated that childhood educators continue to struggle with ideas about the place of art in the curriculum and the most effective way to teach it. Lindsay's (2016) findings showed a variation and some ambiguity in how preschool teachers classified, justified and condemned various art activities and experiences. For some of the participants, any experience or activity that involved art materials was legitimized as art, while others judged the merit of an experience on whether it was messy, unquestioningly equating mess-making and sensory experience with creative expression and development. Lindsay's (2016) study also showed that some preschool teachers labelled the art process more important than the art product. As a result teachers need to assess both the process and the product in the child's creation. Other preschool teachers discerningly classified the various types of experiences as exploratory, experimental, sensor, crafty or artistic, suggesting that different types of art experience may serve different learning goals and purposes (Lindsay, 2016).

## **2.2 The Regional /African Context**

Art education in Africa has been into existence since time immemorial. Most of literature on art education is not readily available while most of literature is found on Early Childhood Education

that encompasses all fields of education without specifically focusing on art education in isolation. Most of the available literature on Early Childhood Education focuses on the importance of art education and Early Childhood Education, the development of Early Childhood Education, the role of teachers and teaching methods in early childhood classroom and challenges faced in Early Childhood Education. This section discusses literature on general information on Early Childhood Education in African Countries, approaches to teaching art in Early Childhood Education and challenges in Early Childhood Education in Africa.

Atta (2012) conducted a qualitative comparative study of two nursery schools of Ayigya MA and KNUST nursery school as a case study in Kumasi in Ghana. Atta's (2012) findings showed that preschools at Kumasi have most of their classes being art based and have the potential to provide a powerful and productive experience. Similar to researches in art education in Europe, Atta's (2012) study showed that the art based method of delivering the curriculum enhances all aspects of the child's education including the neurological development, cognitive learning and the psychosocial growth of the child. Zuilkowski, Fink, Moucheraud and Matafwali (2012) assessed the degree to which ECE can lead to better educational outcomes in Kapiri Mposhi Center in the Zambian Central Province through the use of a case-control design by conducting interviews.

The study showed that attendance of Early Childhood Education is associated with better physical and cognitive development and greater likelihood of on-time transition to primary school. These findings suggest that the school readiness effects of preschool attendance are largest for letter naming and task orientation. Given that most non-attendees in Kapiri are not exposed to the types of learning materials and structured activities that are offered at the Mundane Centre, Zuilkowski et al. (2012) found that the results appear plausible. While the Center does not have

highly-trained teachers, its curricular focus on letters and early literacy skills, early numeracy concepts and group play which help prepare children for primary school.

Art education is important for young children in many respects. As stated by Fox and Berry (2008) and Lindsay (2016), art helps young children in cognitive development. Thus when children attend pre-school where art education is more enhanced, it prepares them for primary education. Zuilkowski et al.'s (2012) found out that children who attend pre-school are likely to enroll in first grade on time than those who do not attend pre-school. These children are also better prepared to learn other materials in the syllabus than those who did not have knowledge of art skills. That is, preschool helps in readying pupils for starting primary school. This effect would be expected given the influence of the professional staff of families' educational decisions, the habit of attending school regularly and the demonstrated value of school attendance. Given that attendance seems to have improved task orientation, Zuilkowski et al. (2012) believed that the benefits of school attendance would be visible to parents. Beginning primary school on time is the first step in children's educational careers, and starting late can be a risk factor for dropout, as late starters will be above-age for their grade as social and economic pressures to leave school increase with age, as alternatives to schools including paid work and marriage become more compelling (Zuilkowski et al., 2012).

### **2.2.1 General information on Early Childhood Education in African Countries**

Despite the Ethiopian government's disengagement in ECE, early childhood has grown from strength to strength in Ethiopia (Mwamwenda, 2014). Prior to 2001, there were 964 schools which increased dramatically to 3 318 schools. Mwamwenda (2014) stressed that ECE plays a significant role in the introduction of basic learning skills which is vital for children's subsequent

formal education at all levels of education. In Lesotho, Mwamwenda (2014) found that children aged four to six years of age who attend preschools are exposed to basic educational skills consisting of pre-writing, pre-reading, and pre-numeracy as starting point for subsequent primary school education.

In Zambia, in 2004 the government placed ECE under the Ministry of Education and was responsible for training of preschool teachers, monitoring standards and developing guidelines (Mwamwenda, 2014). Furthermore, the Ministry of Education has focused on the establishment of ECE centres for rural children and those whose urban parents are poor to achieve this, and the ministry works hand in hand with other ministries, district councils, local communities, Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs), faith-based organizations, families and individuals. Ten years after the establishment of ECE in Lesotho, Mwamwenda (2014) revealed that ECE was established as a formal unit by the Ministry of Education, whose functions were to develop ECE curriculum, run in-service training for teachers and caregivers, develop policy, monitor and regulate ECE programmes. In 2001, in response to the needs of children of poor families unable to access ECE, the government of Lesotho started home-based ECE in four of the ten districts.

### **2.2.2 Approaches to teaching art in Early Childhood Education**

Mangwaya, Blignaut and Pillay (2016) conducted a qualitative study in Zimbabwe using semi structured interviews and documentation to investigate the readiness of schools in the implementation of Early Childhood Education. Mangwaya et al.'s (2016) findings indicated that in Zimbabwe, preschool teachers attended an average of two half-day workshops as preparation for supervising ECE. These teachers were adequately prepared at teacher education institutions and also displayed confidence and a capacity for warm relationships with learners. Mangwaya et

al. (2016)'s findings further revealed that these teachers were said to be nurturing towards ECE learners, skillful communicators, good role models and allowed children to learn through play.

In his study, Atta (2012) discovered that the actual curriculum employed by the Ayigya MA and KNUST Nursery Schools is an amalgamation of all various curriculum perspectives with regard to the role of the learner in knowledge acquisition, the teacher's role of knowledge creation and facilitation, the methods of instruction and the overall approach to the curriculum as prescribed by the Ghana Education Service (GES). Timmermans (2017) conducted a study in Mauritius to assess the quality of pre-primary education. Timmermans (2017)'s study used mixed method approach that included both quantitative and qualitative elements. Observations in the classrooms and interviews with teachers showed that most teachers highly value the National Curriculum Framework (NCF) and use it for their daily planning of activities. The NCF is the guiding document in art activities and dictates the role a player plays and how teachers should conduct classrooms. Moreover, observations showed that all classroom environments are of middle or high quality, thus, they generally provide a good basis for children to learn.

Fox and Berry (2008) stated that there is need for pre-school art teachers to involve families of children in the art activities. Fox and Berry (2008) argued that keeping families involved in the life of the classroom is an important responsibility for early childhood teachers. They asserted that teachers should share with families the role of art in the curriculum and the activities in which their children are participating will encourage their support of the program, and of their children's learning. Furthermore, Fox and Berry (2008) believed that children should be taken to art museums where they will meet with museum staff and other patrons who will take around the museum showing them artistic works while also teaching young children as this would help young children in developing their art skills.

O'Connor (2014) stated that within the field of early childhood art education, two central debates exist: the place of art in the curriculum and the best way of teaching art to young children. O'Connor (2014) identified the progressivism as the first approach to teaching art to young children. Derham in O'Connor (2014) described three stages of artistic development under this model; the manipulative, the symbolic (but recognizable) and the recognizable. O'Connor (2014) stated that the exhibition or display of artwork was held for children in the classroom. Children would select which of their artwork would be displayed in the classroom and the exhibits would be frequently changed as the child lost the intimate relationship to his artwork.

In the 1960s, debates arose around the rationale for teaching art. Instead of teaching art as a form of creative self-expression as in the past, art educators promoted the idea of art as a discipline (O'Connor, 2014). The focus of art education moved from child-centred to subject centred with the development of Discipline Based Art Education. The debate was that art should be considered equal to all other subjects within the curriculum. Therefore, the approach moved from progressivism to Discipline Based Art Education. From this approach, there came Community Based Art Education (CBAE) for young children, a model which linked art to human cultural experience. This challenged the progressive approaches to art education and some model of CBAE included school wide art projects, community based art, the art-in-residence model, children's responses to professional artists (O'Connor, 2014). The third approach to teaching art was known as the Reggio Emilia Approach which acknowledged art as a language and recognized children's use of artistic media as integral to cognitive or symbolic expression involved in learning (Boone, 2007). Reggio Emilia is a town in northern Italy and served as an international model for ECE. The approach emphasized on community and paid attention to aesthetic environment (Boone, 2007).

### **2.2.3 Challenges in Early Childhood Education in Africa**

Perham (2007) conducted a study in Ethiopia that investigated the challenges faced by Early Childhood Education. The findings showed that in the last ten years, the government of Ethiopia has relegated ECE to NGOs, communities and Faith-Based Organizations as it has focused on Primary School Education (PSE). The findings from the study also suggested that in Ethiopia, initially ECE was placed under the Ministry of Local Government, NGOs and communities while in practice, it was run by private providers, NGOs and Faith-Based Organizations (Perham, 2007), therefore making it difficult to access ECE due to high costs of private pre-schools since the government did not regulate ECE. The government through the Ministry of Education provided teacher education whereas the Ministry of Local Government was responsible for legislation of ECE involving child health and nutrition for expectant mothers, and children under the age of five years.

In Lesotho, ECE centres were operated by individuals, private organizations, communities and NGOs although the government had introduced a reception class phase in recent years for five year olds to ensure that prior to joining formal primary education, they complete such programme known as readiness programme. The Ministry of Education and Training for Lesotho (2010) observed that ECE was predominantly accessible to urban children while those in rural areas access remained low. The findings also showed that some teachers had education for such level of education whereas others were not trained. Mangwaya et al.'s (2016) findings showed that pre-schools in Zimbabwe also contained unqualified teachers especially in rural areas and interviewing them did not yield any meaningful information as they did not understand anything. In addition, the school heads in pre-schools were provided with limited preparation for executing their roles with respect to ECE.

Mangwaya et al. (2016) discovered that some of the school heads did not understand what constitutes ECE as well as how ECE learners should be taught. This was the case because ECE in Zimbabwe was incorporated in primary schools and therefore, created challenges for school heads as they were confronted with having to cope with a new reality of managing an introduction and implementation of ECE despite the fact that they were not trained for it. In Zimbabwe, ECE was introduced in primary schools by the Ministry of Education with insufficient consideration of how school heads as key players in curriculum implementation experience the process (Mangwaya et al., 2016). Educational planners seemed to be unaware of the extent of the cultural shift they were requiring school heads to make and these teachers were expected to adjust personal habits, learn new skills, and perform new roles. Furthermore, with respect to availability of appropriate of resources, Mangwaya et al.'s (2016) findings showed that schools had very little to use in the implantation of ECE teaching.

In a study conducted by Azuka (2014), which investigated challenges facing Early Childhood Care and Education implementation in Nigeria, the results revealed that ECE faced an increase of early childhood institutions. Although an increase in the number of institutions was seen as a good thing, the quality of teaching was compromised as pre-schools failed to offer quality services. In addition, ECE also faced lack of competent teachers (Azuka, 2014). Many of the employees were underpaid and this affected the quality of work. Furthermore, Azuka (2014) found that Nigeria was faced with challenges of ineffective supervision of early childhood institutions and this created a poor running structure. In Namibia, Naanda (2008) analyzed the situation regarding the provision of Early Childhood Education and to suggest guidelines to facilitate the implementation of an inclusive approach in the country. The findings showed that a significant majority of early childhood educators in Namibia teach without the necessary teaching

qualifications. In addition, the teachers also lacked experience in special needs, which was a cause for concern, especially with regard to ensuring that children with special needs fully benefited from ECE. This affected the service delivery of instruction in ECE. Naanda (2008) also observed that in Namibia there was lack of easy access to educational institutions for learners with disabilities. As a result, many of young children could not enroll for ECE and many of those who did not enroll for ECE also stayed away from primary education.

### **2.3 The Botswana Context**

A similar approach to the study of art education and Early Childhood Education in Africa is also applicable in Botswana. Most literature (Bose 2008; 2010, Maundeni, 2013; Maunganidze & Tsamaase, 2014) focus on Early Childhood Education. However, none has looked at the relationship between art and Early Childhood Education. Bose (2008) explored the types of ECE programmes available in Botswana, examined the standards and regulations adopted by the ECE programmes as well as the development and adoption of ECE curriculum and learning framework while Maundeni (2013) focused on why and how little attention has been paid to ECE in Botswana as well as the implications of excluding many children from ECE. Maunganidze and Tsamaase (2014) investigated the fit between the internal structure and processes of early childhood centres and the external environment. In Botswana there is no literature on the role of art education in Early Childhood Education. However, Mannathoko (2017) noted that in Botswana lower primary levels of standard 1 to 4 classes practical subjects are grouped together and taught as one subject termed Creative and Performing Arts (CAPA). Therefore, this sections discusses literature on the development of Early Childhood Education and challenges facing Early Childhood Education.

Non-compulsory primary school education in Botswana begins from six years (Bar-On, 2004). Before this age, general programmes variously known as crèches, nursery schools, day-care centres, kindergartens, preschools and reception classes serve children from two and a half years of age (Bar-On, 2004 & Maunganidze & Tsamaase, 2014). Bose (2008; 2010) revealed that Botswana's healthy economy empowered most of the owners of ECE centres to provide necessary physically structures and maintain quality. For an effective ECE, the introduction of a developmentally appropriate curriculum that caters to the child's individuality, pace of learning, age and cultural background for an overall development of a young child is mandatory. Bose (2008) further encourage the need to follow a prescribed standard curriculum that would facilitate the optimal development of a young child.

Bose (2008) observed that the existing ECE programmes were mainly offering day-care and pre-primary services. Due to many challenges in ECE, the government commissioned a study on day care followed by a symposium that called for a direct public intervention in the field to produce appropriate teaching materials and to finance the teaching staff (Bar-On, 2004). In addition, a new policy was drafted "Early Childhood Development Programme Policy in 2001" thus shifting from care to development. The new policy provided aims to provide more children than just a place to be cared for while their parents are at work or studying.

The government recognized that attendance in pre-school education had shown to give children substantive advantages in their later education and therefore, alluded that the early years are critical for the development of the child (Republic of Botswana, 2015a). The government vowed to increase access to pre-primary education and introduced an orientation programme for prospective standard one pupils in 2012 starting around October and reception classes in public schools in 2013 (Republic of Botswana, 2015a). The orientation was for a period of six weeks and

introduced in all public primary schools. The programme was to partly prepare children for learning with the provision of readiness activities and also to help children settle into schools (Republic of Botswana, 2015a). A one year reception programme has been introduced in 115 schools out of a total 756 public schools in 2014 and is estimated to be reaching out to 4 000 children, and was viewed as a major development that would have resource implications and required support and further development (Republic of Botswana, 2015a).

Despite the developments in Early Childhood Education, the role of art in ECE was downplayed as the government never mentioned art in the curriculum nor its policies and education strategies such as ETSSP. In developing and strengthening ECE in Botswana, the Ministry of Basic Education through ETSSP focused on further developing early childhood and pre-primary development system to engage with and respond to the needs of young children and their families so that Botswana's young children have the best possible start in life (Republic of Botswana, 2015a).

The strategy advocates for;

- a) Rolling out reception programmes in all public schools;
- b) Revitalizing and increasing access day care centres/nursery schools through targeted support to private day care centres;
- c) Introducing community-based play groups where there are no schools;
- d) Targeted awareness raising about the importance of early childhood;
- e) Improving and upgrading teachers and carers;
- f) Strengthening the important partnership role of communities, NGOs and government in participating in shaping children's early childhood development;

- g) Better support children with special education needs and to deliver culturally inclusive services (Republic of Botswana, 2015a, p.40).

### **2.3.1 Challenges facing Early Childhood Education in Botswana**

Mwamwenda (2014) reported that although the numbers of ECE centres are huge in Botswana, the number of trained teachers is very small with more of them found in urban areas and much less in rural areas. The majority of teachers are women, while men make only 2 per cent (Bose, 2008 & Maunganidze & Tsamaase, 2014). Bose's (2008; 2010) findings showed that the majority of heads of centres were females making 95 per cent. Maundeni's (2013) revealed that a small number of children in Botswana had access to ECE. Maunganidze and Tsamaase (2014) described ECE in Botswana as a complex mix of types of early childhood care and provision conducted by a diverse range of providers operating in confusing and increasingly complex administrative environments. Bose (2008; 2010) conducted a survey research design using both quantitative and qualitative approaches establishing the current scenario of ECE programmes in Gaborone. The findings of the study also showed that almost half of the population providing ECE is without formal training on Early Childhood Education and yet they are recruited as teachers.

In Botswana, Bose (2008; 2010) and Maunganidze & Tsamaase's (2014) observed that evidence showed that lack of adequate training centres, academic insecurity, language barriers and inability to pay for coursework are faced by early care and education teachers in improving their qualifications and capacity so as to help create a knowledgeable and qualified workforce. In this regard, Maunganidze and Tsamaase (2014) revealed that early childhood programmes in Botswana are unevenly distributed with fragmented and wide differences in both quantity and quality. This existing differences in quality and outcomes within and between ECE services offered in Botswana diverge from the growing body of international evidence showing effects of quality setting,

experiences and pedagogy on children's wellbeing and developmental outcomes. Emerging from this evidence is the central role of early childhood practitioners in promoting quality experiences and environments for young children yet training for ECE teachers is still fragmented, and there is still no agreed position on how early childhood curriculum should be structured or what values, learning experiences and outcomes could and should be expected and promoted.

Bose (2008) stated that in 2008 there was only one centre in Botswana which produced only 30 teachers per year for the whole country, and this fell short of satisfying the demand while the centres have since increased to meet the demand. Bose's (2008) findings indicated that ECE centres did not follow any standard, prescribed curriculum and there is still no prescribed curriculum. According to Bar-On (2004), the absence of any curriculum guidelines leads to operators doing as much as they please. Due to unavailability of a prescribed and standard ECE curriculum, centres used alternatives like adopting either a South African curriculum or a combination of curriculum prescribed by other countries. As a result, Maundeni (2013) observed that the government's decision to play an indirect role in ECE is to blame for many of the problems facing ECE. In addition, the findings showed that many of the centres used self-made curriculum, based on various themes or followed curriculum adopted by Montessori Method. However, an encouraging picture was observed as all centres had planned activities and provided indoor materials like painting, clay, pictures, scissors, chart book and alphabets, building blocks, puzzles, toys, story books, toy chairs and tables, Lego, memo cards, plaster seal that are part and parcel of Developmentally Appropriate Practices. Many of the pre-school centres observed had lesson plans or even general work schemes and the same games and exercises were repeated time and again (Bar-On, 2004). Consequently, a child who attended a centre for a number of years would have

undertaken the same activities not only during each year but year after year. In most rural programmes, learning took place is mainly by rote.

## **2.4 Summary**

This chapter discussed literature on art education and Early Childhood Education internationally, in Africa and Botswana in particular. In the international perspective, researchers have produced volumes of literature in art education in developed countries. The chapter discussed the role of art education in Early Childhood Education. Studies assert that art education helps to meet various learning styles of all children, it significantly improve social skills, imaginary and intellectual skills, physical and cognitive developments of children (Novakovic, 2015; Lindsay, 2016 & Yazici, 2017). The chapter discussed the role of teachers in Early Childhood Education. The findings indicated that teachers act as guides for young children in making art as well as provide an enabling environment for young children to learn art (Gunn, 2000). The chapter discussed art activities and perspectives in Early Childhood Education. Most of art curriculum feature play-based activities, where young children spend most of the time they mix colours, play with clay and playdough (Garvis, 2012).

The chapter discussed literature in the regional context. It has been argued that art existed many years go in Africa though there is literature specifically on art education while there is vast literature in Early Childhood Education. It is stated that attendance of Early Childhood Education is associated with better physical and cognitive development and greater likelihood of on-time transition from pre-school, to primary school (Mwamwenda, 2014 & Republic of Botswana, 2015a). The chapter also provided general information on Early Childhood Education in African countries. Early Childhood Education in African countries is said to be growing. It is also said that

ECE in most African countries such as Lesotho, Ethiopia, Botswana, Zambia and Zimbabwe were mainly in the hands of private individuals mostly foreigners, churches and NGOs.

The chapter discussed approaches to teaching art in Early Childhood Education. Researchers identified three approaches to teaching art to young children which are progressivism, which is a child centred approach (O'Connor, 2014). In the 1960s, the approach shifted to discipline based art education (DBAE); the idea of teaching art as a discipline replaced the progressivism. Later on, the Reggio Emilia Approach came into existence which acknowledged and recognized art as a language (Boone, 2007). The chapter discussed challenges in Early Childhood Education. Many governments in Africa such as Lesotho, Botswana, and Zimbabwe relegated ECE to NGOs, communities and Faith-Based Organizations (FBO) while they focused on primary education and other higher levels of education. This created problems as many young children could not access ECE due to high costs as governments did not regulate prices (Maundeni, 2013; Maunganidze & Tsamaase, 2014).

The chapter discussed literature in the Botswana context. Literature on the role of art education in Early Childhood Education is not available. It is argued that Botswana does not have a specific curriculum of ECE and therefore, pre-schools are doing as they please (Maunganidze & Tsamaase, 2014). The chapter discussed challenges facing Early Childhood Education in Botswana. Many pre-school teachers were not trained in ECE and many young children were missing from ECE due to high costs.

## **Chapter 3: Research Methodology**

### **3.0 Introduction**

This chapter discusses the research approaches, research design, research paradigms, research site, population of the study, sample, sampling procedures, data collection methods, piloting the research instruments, data analysis procedures, trustworthiness of research and ethical considerations for this study.

### **3.1 Research Approaches**

The research approach is a plan, structure and strategy of investigation conceived to obtain answers to research questions or problems (Mahajan, 2017). A research approach relates to the identification of procedures and logistical arrangements to start a study. It also emphasizes the importance of quality in producing optimized research results (Mahajan, 2017). Newman (2011) outlined three types of research approaches; quantitative, qualitative and mixed study. This study adopts the qualitative approach to research among the three types. Patton (2015) described qualitative research as an approach that is concerned with how the social world is interpreted, understood, experienced, produced and construed. It is also an approach based on methods of data generation which are both flexible and sensitive to the social context in which data are produced (rather than rigidly standardized or structured or entirely abstracted from 'real-life' contexts) (Patton, 2015).

Furthermore, Patton (2015) asserted that qualitative approach is based on methods of analysis, explanation and argument building which involve understandings of complexity, detail and context. Thus it aims to produce rounded and contextual understandings on the basis of rich, nuanced and detailed data. Qualitative approach is defined as a method of inquiry employed in

many different academic disciplines, traditionally in the Social Sciences, but also in other disciplines such as in market research and other different contexts. It is concerned with the social aspects of the world and it seeks to answer questions of how, why and what way (Neuman, 2011). This means that qualitative approach is good for an exploration study.

Qualitative approach is also described as a type of scientific research which consists of investigations that seek answers to questions, collect evidence, and produce findings that were not determined in advance (Neuman, 2011). In addition, Cropley (2019) stated that qualitative approach seeks to understand a given research problem or topic from the perspectives of the local population it involves. Mahajan (2017) was of the view that qualitative approach is much more subjective than quantitative research and uses different methods of collecting data such as the focus group discussion, in-depth interviews and participant observation. This study therefore, tries to collect first-hand information through interviews and observations and hope to produce findings that were not previously produced. The use of qualitative approach benefits this study in that the findings would be detailed and be of quality as a result of use of more than one method of data collection.

As aforementioned, this study will adopt the qualitative approach because of the phenomena to study as it requires studying people in their natural setting through research methods of interviews and observations as well as their subjective meanings, understandings and interpretation of the social world (Neuman, 2011). This study is exploratory and descriptive in nature hence the adoption of the qualitative approach. The qualitative approach is best suitable for this study as qualitative methods are flexible and sensitive to the social context compared to quantitative methods. The qualitative approach will enable this study to produce rich and detailed

findings, and to also explain complex phenomena that would not be produced by quantitative research.

### **3.2 Research Design**

Conrad and Serlin (2011, p.45) defined a research design as “the conceptual structure within which the research is conducted.” It constitutes the blueprint for the collection, measurement and analysis of data. Conrad and Serlin (2011) stated that a research design entails the overall strategy that integrates study components in a logical way. Among the different types of research designs, this study will use a case study design. Yin (2011) defined a case study as a master plan for the determined methods, structure, and strategy of a research to find out alternative tools to solve the problems and to minimize the variances. Research design deals with a logical problem and not a logistical problem (Yin, 2011). This study will use a case study design.

#### **3.2.1 A case-study**

Case studies are defined as strategies rather than methods (Ditshwane, 2015). Yin (2014) asserted that case study design, through reports of past studies, allows the exploration and understanding of complex issues. It is a robust research method particularly when a holistic in-depth investigation is required. In the case study, one particular group or organizations is selected and studied in depth and events that occur in that context are studied as they naturally occur. The researcher is aiming to gain depth in one area rather than shallower breadth obtained through the use of surveys. Starman (2013) noted that a case study method enables a researcher to closely examine the data within a specific context. In most cases, a case study method selects a small geographical area or a very limited number of individuals as the subjects of study. This study therefore is a case study of Kgatleng region and the researcher will select five pre-schools in the Region. Case studies in

their true essence, explore and investigate contemporary real-life phenomenon through detailed contextual analysis of a limited number of events or condition, and their relationships (Starman, 2013). Though pre-schools are all over the country in Botswana, the focus of this study will be pre-schools in Kgatleng region in order to have an in-depth understanding of the role of art in Early Childhood Education in a specific area.

### **3.3 Research paradigms**

Kivunja and Kuyin (2017) defined a paradigm “as a basic system or worldview that guides the investigation (p.26),” while Shah and Al-Bargi (2013) defined the concept as a shared worldview that represents the beliefs and values in a discipline and that guides how problems are solved. Rahman and Alharthi (2016) asserted that research paradigm plays a critical role in the Social Sciences as well as educational research in helping people understand problems as well as providing solutions to such problems. Creswell (2013) outlined two paradigms in research as being the positivist and interpretive paradigm. This study will adopt the interpretive paradigm.

The interpretive paradigm is considered as constructivist, naturalistic, humanistic and anti-positivist and emerged in contradiction to positivism for the understanding and interpretation of human and social reality (Shah & Al-Bargi, 2013). Kivunya & Kuyin (2017) asserted that this approach ‘looks for culturally derived and historically situated interpretations of the social life-world.’ The paradigm is concerned with subjective meanings as it seeks to recognize the individual’s interpretation and understanding of the social phenomena (Thanh, & Thanh, 2015). Since social research is guided by the researcher’s desire to understand social reality, all is interpretive (Yin, 2011). Hussain, Elyas and Nasseef (2013) argued that researchers cannot distance themselves from the object being observed, the subject matter and the methods of the

study. In contrast to positivists, interpretivists assume that there is no objective knowledge which is independent of thinking and reasoning by humans, so knowledge and meaning are acts of interpretation (Thanh & Thanh, 2015). The researcher will also interpret the social reality on the basis of her own understandings as well as from the point of view of the participants.

Interpretivists aim to explore individual's perceptions, share their meanings and develop insights about the observed case (Bryman, 2008). This study will use the interpretive paradigm as it deals with people in their natural setting. Babbie (2010) asserted that the approach is also suitable for a qualitative study as interpretivists believe that social reality is subjective and nuanced because it is shaped by the perceptions of participants, as well as the values and aims of the researcher. The interpretive paradigm is suitable for this study because this study is about the social world and studies people in their natural settings (preschools) through observations and interviews on art education and Early Childhood Education which are subjective shaped by their perceptions and their values. This study is concerned with the subjective meanings of art education in preschools of individuals' interpretation and understanding of art education in ECE. Therefore, this study adopts the interpretive paradigm because it aims to explore the participants' perceptions, how they share their meanings and develop insights about art education in ECE.

### **3.4 Research site**

This study will be conducted in Kgatleng region in Botswana. Kgatleng region (District) is located in the South-Eastern part of Botswana and covers a region of 7 600km<sup>2</sup> (Tshireletso, Cooke, 1981). The region is approximately 30km north of the capital city of Gaborone along the main North-South road. The region has approximately 91 660 population (Republic of Botswana, 2011). Mochudi is the largest village in the district and have many other villages such as Pilane,

Rasesa, Morwa, Matebeleng, Oodi, Modipane, Mabalane, Sikwane, Mmathubudikwane, Ramonaka, Malolwane, Oliphant's Drift, Artesia, Malolwane, Leshibitse, Ramotlabaki, Kgomodiatshaba, Dikgonnye and other settlements (Republic of Botswana, 2016b). Kgatleng region has 34 pre-primary schools with 717 pupil enrollment and 133 Batswana teachers and 145 non-Batswana teachers (Republic of Botswana, 2016a).

### **3.5 Population of the study**

The population refers to all subjects that the researcher finds ideal and relevant to provide information in relation to the study or which the researcher targets for the study (Creswell, 2013 & Murphy, 2016). Yin (2011) also defined population as the universe or collection of all elements, businesses being described or measured by a sample. In essence, population is a group of individuals, persons, objects, or items from which samples are taken for measurement. The population in this study comprise of 34 pre-primary schools in Kgatleng region. From the 34 pre-primary schools, five preschool classes will be chosen for the study whereby teachers who administer or teach the selected classes will be interviewed. Kgatleng region is chosen primarily because of its proximity and convenience and the region is not broad; that is, the schools in this region are close to one another.

### **3.6 Sample**

A sample is a finite part of a statistical population whose properties are studied to gain information about the whole (Yin, 2011). When dealing with people, a sample can be defined as a set of respondents (people) selected from a larger population for the purpose of a survey (Landreneau & Creek, 2008). Kgatleng region comprise of 34 pre-primary schools (Republic of Botswana, 2016b). Therefore, five pre-primary schools will be selected from the main villages of

Kgatlang which comprise of Mochudi, Rasesa, Bokaa and other small villages of Oodi and Modipane. Alvi (2016) observed that in sampling one would like to obtain a sample that is representative of the target population. To be 'representative' means to provide a close approximation of certain characteristics of the target group (Hornby & Witter, 2010). Thus, the selected population will have the characteristics of preschools in the region.

### **3.7 Sampling techniques**

Sampling is the act, process or technique of selecting a suitable sample or a representative part of the population for the purpose of determining parameters or characteristics of the whole population (Etikan & Bala, 2017). The purpose of sampling is to draw conclusions about the population from samples by using inferential statistics which enables researchers to determine a population's characteristics by directly observing only a portion of the population (Yin, 2014). According to Sarstedt, Bengart, Shaltoni and Lehmann (2017), sampling means to reduce bias and for making inferences from findings based on a portion of the larger population. Qualitative research uses purposeful sampling the most because it uses small samples (Saunders, Lewis & Thornhill, 2012).

To choose the sample from the 34 schools in Kgatlang region, purposive sampling will be used to select schools that will participate in the study. Purposive sampling methods may employ the following sampling techniques; maximal variation, extreme, typical, theory, homogeneous, critical, opportunistic, snowball, confirming and disconfirming sampling. These types of purposeful sampling have their own advantages and disadvantages therefore, careful selection should be exercised to align to the study. Purposeful sampling is used in qualitative research because the sample is expected to best help the researcher to understand the study and they are

usually expected to help other people to learn about the situation and to give voice to the silenced (Yin, 2014 & Patton, 2015). Etikan Musa and Alkassim (2016) asserted that purposive sampling also known as judgement sampling involves a deliberate choice of participants due to the qualities the participants possesses. The technique is good in selecting the information-rich cases for the most proper utilization of available resources. This involves the identification and selection of individuals or groups of individuals that are proficient and well-informed with a phenomenon of interest, as well as the importance of the availability to communicate experiences and opinions in an articulate, expressive and reflective manner (Etikan et al., 2016).

For the purpose of this study, homogeneous purposive sampling will be used because it focuses on similar characteristics of participants which are expected to allow them to be explored in greater depth. These will be ECE teachers chosen from the 34 schools. Homogenous purposive sampling allows the researcher to choose the subject of her choice looking at her interests (Hornby & Witter, 2010). The sampling technique has a strength of saving time and costs as compared to other sampling techniques. Gentles, Charles, Ploeg and Mckibbon (2015) stated that in purposive sampling, the investigator relies on his or her discretion in selecting units that are representative or typical of the population. In this study, the researcher is interested on those preschools with over five years of existence. In addition, the pre-schools should have teachers trained in Early Childhood Education and with more than one class of students.

### **3.8 Data collection methods**

Simister and Garbutt (2017) defined data collection as the process of gathering and measuring the information on the variables of interest, which is an established systematic fashion that enables the respondent to answer stated research questions, test hypothesis, and evaluate

outcomes. This study will use two methods of data collection which are observation and in-depth interviews. According to Creswell (2013) and Patton (2015), interviews and documents are the most common sources of data collection in qualitative research. The researcher chooses to use interviews and observations as they allow for broad information to be collected within a short period of time. The two methods of data collection are discussed below.

### **3.8.1 Classroom observation**

This study will use observation as one of the methods for data collection. Observation is one of the types of data collection method used in qualitative research. An unobtrusive observation will be carried out. Crossman (2016) observed that in unobtrusive observation, the researcher or observer participates in on-going activities and records observations without fear as participants will be aware that they are being observed. In this study, the researcher will observe the selected classes. Each class will be observed for two consecutive days in order to have a full grasp and understanding of the class routine activities, resources and teaching methods employed in the classrooms. The first day will be used purely for observation while on the second day, the researcher will begin with interviews and observe later. To conduct the observations, an observation checklist prepared will be used as a guide. The observation will focus on the role of art in ECE; how teachers use art in early childhood classes, the challenges faced by teachers when teaching Early Childhood Education through art, and how the teachers address the challenges in the teaching of ECE through art. The researcher will also observe the teaching methods/approaches used in ECE, and the art activities undertaken by pupils.

The classroom observation is advantageous because it is a direct method of collecting data or information, that is, it is the best method in terms of collecting first-hand information as the researcher has to witness what is really happening than relying on people's views (Dodiya,

Kapadiya & Malvaniya, 2014). Although this method is good, it has its own limitations. The observed may adopt pretentious behavior to be more effective than usual (the Hawthorne effect). The presence of the researcher in the classroom who is observing might affect the natural behavior of teacher and students as teachers or students may appear to be more involved in the activities or the teacher may appear not to be involved in the activities (Dodiya et al., 2014). In mitigating against these limitations, the researcher will not interfere with the participants to allow them to go on about their daily activities uninterrupted and therefore, collect valid data. This would allow the subjects to conduct their activities uninhibited and reduce the Hawthorne effect.

### **3.8.2 In-depth interviews**

This study will use in-depth interviews as a method of data collection. Brouneus (2011) and Steber (2017) defined in-depth interviews as open-ended, discovery oriented method that is well suited for describing both program processes and outcomes from the perspective of the target audience or key stakeholders. The use of a question guide is a qualitative research technique that involves conducting intensive individual interviews with a small number of respondents to explore their perspectives on a particular idea, program or situation (Brouneus, 2011). The advantage of in-depth interviews is that interviews provide much more detailed information than what is available through other data collection methods (Neuman, 2011).

Neuman (2011) added that interview guides allow the researcher to be systematic and solicit information that had not been anticipated because it does not insist upon asking specific questions in a specific order. This therefore, makes interview guides very productive in terms of probing for information from respondents, and in terms of seeking clarity where necessary because there is direct contact between the researcher and the respondents. Bailey (2016) asserted that

question guides entail a list of open-ended questions for participants to fully express their responses in as much detail as they desired. Furthermore, question guides allow for restructuring of questions or even asking new questions where necessary depending on the conversation (Steber, 2017).

The in-depth interview guides will comprise of main questions that seek to address the research objectives. The interview process will provide a platform for preschool teachers to express their conceptions about art and Early Childhood Education. The method of in-depth interviews has more benefits because the interview offers the opportunity to ask follow-up questions and probe for additional information than other methods such as the survey (Neuman, 2011). In addition, the method is insightful and provides the possibility of identifying highly valuable findings very quickly. The strength of in-depth interviews in this study is that the method offers the researcher an opportunity to probe for more information as compared to the survey method. The researcher can always go back to participants for more information or clarity even after the interview.

Despite its advantages, the in-depth interview method has its own limitations. The method is time consuming as more time is taken to conduct the interviews starting from preparations for the interviews (Neuman, 2011). The researcher will focus only on few schools and will not have too many questions. This will give participants an opportunity to talk more while the researcher will be listening more. This provides participants the freewill to fully express themselves without being interrupted by the researcher as the researcher will only have minimal injections when necessary. Interviews will be conducted on the second day of the visit to the schools. The interviews will be one hour long and superseded by observation. The interviews will be conducted outside the classroom to allow a smooth interview as young children are prone to producing a lot

of noise. The researcher will use a tape-recorder to capture the interview to inform the next interviews and lesson observations. The tape recorder also allows the researcher to repeatedly listen to the interview for clarity.

### **3.9 Pilot of the study**

The study will be piloted in two of the public pre-schools in Kweneng region to check relevance and clarity of research questions. Two teachers will be interviewed. The schools to be chosen will not be far from Kgatleng where the main study will be conducted for proximity and convenience purposes. Two pre-schools classes will be observed and later interview class teachers of observed classes to test the research instruments. Piloting of the study ensures credibility and also tests if the question guide is able to provide the study with the required information, or if the instrument is able to address the research objectives (Ismail, Kinchin & Edwards, 2018).

### **3.10 Data analysis procedures**

According to Sharma (2018), among the characteristics of qualitative research, there is the use of inductive data analysis. Flick (2013) asserted that data analysis is a summary of the collected data in a dependable and accurate manner. Data analysis is the process of bringing order, structure and meaning to the mass of collected data. Sharma (2018) argued that data analysis is a messy, ambiguous, time-consuming, creative and fascinating process. Thus data is organized into units or categories, and the researcher attempts to find relationships among those categories. The process of inductive analysis involves condensing extensive and varied raw text into a brief summary format (Theron, 2014). The researcher then establishes clear links between the research objectives and the summary findings derived from the raw data and to ensure these links are both transparent

and defensible (Theron, 2014). Lastly, Theron (2014) asserted that the researcher develop a model or theory about the underlying structure of experiences or processes which are evident in the text.

For this research, data collected from interviews will be organized according to research questions while data from observations will be organised according to the observation checklist. Then the data will be organised into themes that emerge from the data for presentation of the findings. The views of the participants will also be presented in verbatim as the findings for interpretation. Thus central phenomenon themes will be developed and presented in narrative form. The results from interviews and observation will be compared and contrasted to produce a single interpretation and then conclusions drawn. In other words, analysis and interpretations of research findings will be in line with the study objectives and research questions presented.

### **3.11 Trustworthiness of Research**

Anney (2014) and Devault (2018) asserted that trustworthiness in qualitative research is ensured through credibility, triangulation, member checks and transferability of the findings.

#### **3.11.1 Credibility**

In qualitative research, Anney (2014) stated that qualitative investigators' credibility deals with the question of "how congruent are the findings with reality (p. 276)?" while Devault (2018) argued that ensuring credibility is one of the most important factors in establishing trustworthiness. Merriam (2009) defined credibility as the believability of the findings and is enhanced by evidence such as confirming evaluation of conclusions by research participants, convergence of multiple sources of evidence, control of unwanted influences and theoretical fit. The researcher will develop an early familiarity with the culture of the participating preschools before the first data collection

and dialogue take place so that the researcher is not a complete stranger when collecting data. This will be achieved through visitations to the preschools and consultations with the management of the schools. Anney (2014) and Devault (2018) recommended “prolonged engagement” between the investigator and the participants in order for the investigator to gain an adequate understanding of an organization and to establish a relationship of trust between the parties. Therefore, the researcher will spend more time with the participants to gain adequate understanding of the preschools and also establish a cordial relationship with the subjects or participants.

In addition, Merriam (2009) argued that credibility is ensured through saturation. This means that the researcher will continuously collect data to the point where more data collected add little or no value to regularities that have already surfaced. The study will further enhance its credibility through pattern matching, which Merriam (2009) described as the trustworthiness and vigor of qualitative research and its data analysis are boosted by a general procedure, a strategy for aligning data to theoretical propositions. Furthermore, this study will ensure credibility by using tactics to ensure honesty in informants when contributing data. In particular, the researcher will ensure that each participant approached is given an opportunity to refuse to participate in the study in order to ensure that the data collection sessions involve only those who are genuinely willing to take part and prepared to offer data freely. Anney (2014) argued that participants should be asked to be frank from the outset of each session, with the researcher aiming to establish a rapport in the opening moments. Lastly, the researcher will ensure credibility through the use of iterative questioning as a strategy in order to uncover deliberate lies (Anney, 2014). This involves the use of probe to elicit detailed data and iterative questioning, in which the researcher returns to matters previously raised by an informant and extracts related data through rephrased questions.

### **3.11.2 Triangulation**

Triangulation “involves the use of multiple and different methods, investigators, sources and theories to obtain corroborating evidence” (Onwuegbuzie & Leech, 2007, p. 239). Triangulation helps the investigator to reduce bias and it cross examines the integrity of participants’ responses. There are three major triangulation techniques. The first is investigator triangulation that uses multiple researchers to investigate the same problem, which brings different perceptions of the inquiry and helps to strengthen the integrity of the findings. The second is data triangulation/informants triangulation that uses different sources of data or research instruments, such as interviews, focus group discussion or participant observation, or that utilizes different informants to enhance the quality of the data from different source. The third is methodological triangulation that uses different research methods (Denzin & Lincoln, 2005). In this study, the researcher will use triangulation, that involves the use of more than one method of data collection mainly classroom observation and in-depth interviews (Merriam, 2009). These methods are the most common sources of data as well as data collection in qualitative researches in social research as they have been tested and proved to be credible methods of producing quality data (Anney, 2014).

Classroom observation will be used as the main method of data collection and complemented with the in-depth interviews. Where possible, supporting data may be obtained from documents to provide a background to help explain the attitudes and behavior of those in the group under scrutiny, as well as to verify particular details that participants have supplied.

### **3.11.3 Member Checks**

Another strategy for improving the quality of qualitative data is allowing member checks. Member checks mean that the “data and interpretations are continuously tested as they are derived from members of various audiences and groups from which data are solicited” (Anney, 2014). Member checks is a crucial process that any qualitative researcher should undergo because it is the heart of credibility (Onwuegbuzie & Leech, 2007). Researcher(s) are required to include the voices of respondents in the analysis and interpretation of the data. The purpose of doing member checks is to eliminate researcher bias when analyzing and interpreting the results. This means that the analyzed and interpreted data is sent back to the participants for them to evaluate the interpretation made by the inquirer and to suggest changes if they are unhappy with it or because they had been misreported. Informants may reject an interpretation made by the researcher, either because it was socially undesirable or because of the way in which it was presented by the researcher (Schwandt, Lincoln & Guba, 2007). The member checks strategy involves establishing structural corroboration or coherence, i.e. testing all the data to ensure that there is no internal conflict or inconsistencies, and establishing referential adequacy (Devault, 2018). In presenting and analyzing the findings of this study, the researcher will present the findings as said by the participants (verbatim) or through direct quotations. This would ensure that the researcher does not misinterpret the words of the participants.

### **3.11.4 Transferability**

Transferability refers to the degree to which the results of qualitative research can be transferred to other contexts with other respondents – it is the interpretive equivalent of generalizability (Bitsch, 2005). According to Bitsch (2005), the “researcher facilitates the transferability judgment by a potential user through ‘thick description’ and purposeful sampling”

(p. 85). This means that when the researcher provides a detailed description of the enquiry and participants were selected purposively, it facilitates transferability of the inquiry. In this study, the researcher will ensure transferability by providing thick descriptions, i.e. by providing rich and extensive set of details concerning methodology and context. The researcher will elucidate all the processes, from data collection, context of the production of the final report. This would allow other researchers to replicate the study with similar conditions in other settings.

### **3.11.5 Dependability**

According to Bitsch (2005), dependability refers to “the stability of findings over time” (p. 86). Dependability involves participants evaluating the findings and the interpretation and recommendations of the study to make sure that they are all supported by the data received from the informants of the study (Cohen, Manion & Morrison, 2011). Dependability is established using an audit trail, a code-recode strategy, stepwise replication, triangulation and peer examination or iterator comparisons (Schwandt et al., 2007 & Ary, Jacobs, Razavieh & Sorensen, 2010). In this study, the researcher will immediately after collecting data code the data. After a week (gestation period), the researcher would re-code the same data again. The results from the two coding would then be compared to determine if they are different.

### **3.12 Ethical considerations**

In the process of research, the European Commission (2013) cautioned that researchers have a moral obligation to attempt to minimize the risk of physical and or mental harm to themselves and to their colleagues from the conduct of research. This therefore means that it is the researcher’s obligation to ensure that no harm come to participants in any way, no matter the potential benefits of the research. The European Commission (2013) emphasized that the

researcher should evaluate whether the benefits of the research outweighs the cost to participate. In this study, the researcher has an obligation to protect her subjects from any form of harm that may come their way because of their participation in this study. In addition, the researcher will not make any promise that art will be stopped or elevated in status to be in the same level as mathematics of sciences. Furthermore, the researcher will not raise any hopes of participants that they will be taken for formal training in art. This study will further adhere to the research ethics below:

### **3.12.1 Obtaining informed consent**

The most important research ethic is to gain access and trust of the participants lest the researcher gets from the field without data. Fouka and Mantzorou (2011) argued that inquiry involving human subjects should be based as far as practicable on the freely given informed consent of subjects. This study involves the use of people as subjects or respondents and this means that these individuals will not be under the impression that they are required to participate. Participants will be made aware of their entitlement to refuse at any stage for whatever reason and to withdraw data supplied.

In addition, the researcher will not deliberately withhold any information from participants that will likely affect the participants' willingness to participate since this will remove from them an important means of protecting their own interests. According to Nijhawan, Janodia, Muddukrishna, Bhat, Bairy, Ndupa and Musmade (2013) and Manti and Licari (2018), gaining informed consent is a procedure for ensuring that research subjects understand what is being done to them, the limits to their participation, and awareness of any potential risks that may occur. The researcher will obtain a research permit from research permits issuing bodies such as the Ministry

of Basic Education and the office of research and development for adherence of research ethics. The researcher will also seek signed informed consent from participants as evidence that consent was gained from the participants.

### **3.12.2 Confidentiality and anonymity**

The second ethics to adhere to in this study is confidentiality and anonymity of respondents. According to Kaiser (2009), a research should not pose any danger to subjects through their participation in a study, and this is applicable to this study. Saunders, Kitzinger and Kitzinger (2015) argued that even if the subjects do not perceive any danger to themselves by providing data to a study, the researcher shall maintain principles of confidentiality and anonymity as far as possible so that the interests of the subjects are protected in order not to contaminate the field for future research. In addition, the researcher will also take appropriate measures to prevent data from being released or published in a way that compromise the identity of participants. In ensuring that the participants information remain confidential and anonymous, the researcher will not use real names of the participating schools as well as preschool teachers, pseudo names will be assigned to the participants as well as to the participating schools so that the information is not linked back to the participants.

### **3.12.4 Beneficence**

Fouka and Mantzorou (2011) asserted that the ethical principle of beneficence refers to the Hippocratic “be of benefit, do not harm.” Fouka and Mantzorou (2011) believed that it is sometimes difficult to predict danger when creating a hypothesis especially in qualitative research and for this study, the researcher will try by all means to protect her participants from danger as a result from participating in this study. This would be done through using pseudo names in place

of the real names of participants and also using codes in place of participants as the participants are also anonymous to the researcher. In addition, the researcher will inform the participants about the dangers of taking part in the study so that they can also protect themselves.

### **3.13 Summary**

The chapter discussed the research methodology that will be used in data collection for this study. This chapter will use the qualitative approach as it requires studying people in their natural setting and for its rich approach in studying and explaining phenomena (Neuman, 2011). The chapter also discussed the research design for the study. The study will adopt a case study design in order to explore and understand complex issues by studying cases at small scale in detail (Yin, 2014). The chapter discussed the research paradigm for the study. This research will adopt the interpretive paradigm which concerns itself with the subjective meanings to recognize the individual's interpretation and understanding of the social phenomena under study than the positivist paradigm which is more suitable in the natural sciences (Thanh & Thanh, 2015). The chapter discussed the research site, which will be Kgatleng region. Then region is located in the south-eastern Botswana, 30 km north of Gaborone city. The chapter discussed the population of the study. The population will be 34 pre-primary schools in Kgatleng region.

The chapter discussed the sample and the sampling techniques of the study. This study proposed that from the 34 pre-primary schools in Kgatleng region, five pre-primary schools will be sampled for observation and teachers administering the pre-school classes for interviews. The sample will be selected using homogenous purposive sampling which focuses on similar characteristics of participants which are expected to allow them to be explored in greater depth (Etikan, et al., 2016). The chapter discussed data collection methods. The methods were proposed

to be in-depth interviews and observation methods where five pre-school classes will be observed in Kgatleng region, and interviews with the observed class teachers follow. The chapter discussed the piloting of the study. The researcher proposed that a pilot study will be carried out in two public pre-schools in Kweneng region to check relevance and clarity of research questions. The chapter also discussed data analysis procedures for the study. The chapter discussed that data from interviews will be organized according to research questions while data from observations will be organized according to the observation check-list. Then, themes will be generated from data for presentation. In presenting the findings, views of respondents will be presented together with data in narrative form.

The chapter discussed the trustworthiness of the research. This study proposed that trustworthiness of the research will be achieved through credibility, triangulation, member checks, transferability and dependability. Participants will be given an opportunity to refuse to participate so that only those who are willing to participate do so at their own admission. The study proposed to use more than one method of data collection to complete one another, and these will enhance the quality of the study (Merriam, 2009). The chapter discussed research ethics for the study. The study will adhere to ethics of obtaining informed consent, confidentiality and anonymity, and beneficence. The researcher vowed to ensure that participants will be provided with relevant truthful information about the research in order to make an informed decision whether to participate in the study or not and also to volunteer to take part in the study. The researcher also promised to protect the participants from any harm that may come their way as a result of their participation in the study, and this could be achieved through concealment of their identity by using pseudo names and codes.

**Table 3: Research Plan**

| Chapters                                  | Activity  | Duration  |
|---|---|---|
| <b>Chapter 1</b>                          | -Introduction   | 11 months                                       |
| <b>Introduction and problem statement</b> | -Develop statement of the problem<br>Develop research objectives/research questions                                     | 15 January 2018 to<br>30 November 2018          |
| <b>Chapter 2</b>                          | Search for relevant literature for the area for review<br>Critically assess the literature                              | 10 weeks<br>21 January 2019 to<br>29 March 2019 |
| <b>Chapter 3</b>                          | Develop research methodology  | 09 weeks  |
| <b>Research Methodology</b>               | -Research approach<br>-Research design<br>-Paradigm<br>-Population<br>-Sampling<br>-Research ethics<br>-Data collection | 15 April to 07 June<br>2019                     |

Source: Developed by Ponatshego Mmolotsi (2019)

## References

Admas, F. (2016). Early Childhood Education in Ethiopia: Present Practices and Future Directions.

*The Ethiopian Journal of Education*, 36 (2), 41-72.

Alvi, M. (2016). *A Manual for Selecting Sampling Techniques in Research*. University of Karachi,

Iqra University.

Anney, V.N. (2014). Ensuring the Quality of the Findings of Qualitative Research: Looking at

Trustworthiness Criteria. *Journal of Emerging Trends in Educational Research and Policy*

*Studies*, 5 (2), 272-281.

Ary, D., Jacobs, L. C., Razavieh, A., & Sorensen, C.K. (2010). *Introduction to research in*

*Education (8 Ed.)*. New York, NY: Hult Rinchart & Wiston.

Atta, Y.K. (2012). *A Comparative Study of Early Childhood Education in Selected Public and*

*Pre-Schools in Kumasi*. Kumasi: Kwame Nkrumah University of Science and

Technology.

Azuka, O.I. (2014). Challenges Facing Early Childhood Case and Education Implementation in

Nigeria and the Way Forward. *Journal of Research in Education*, 3 (1), 54-60.

Babbie, E. (2010). *The Basics of Social Research*. Sydney: Wadsworth Cengage.

Bailey, D.O. (2016). Setting a Research Question, Aim and Objectives. *Nurse Researcher*, 23

(4), 19-23.

Bar-On, A. (2014). Early Childhood Care and Education in Africa: The Case of Botswana.

*Journal of Early Childhood Research*, 2 (1), 67-84. Doi: 10.1177/1476718X0421004.

Bitsch, V. (2005). Qualitative research: A grounded theory example and evaluation criteria.

*Journal of Agribusiness*, 23(1), 75-91.

Boone, D.J. (2007). *A Picasso or a preschooler?: Ways of seeing the child as artists*. Australia:

Queensland University of Technology.

Bose, K. (2008). Gaps and Remedies of Early Childhood Care and Education (ECCE) Programs

of Botswana. *Educational Research and Reviews*, 3 (3), 77-82.

Bose, K. (2010). The Issue of Holistic Development of Young Children in ECE Centres of

Botswana. *Literacy Information and Computer Education Journal (LICEJ)*, 1 (2), 87-94.

Botswana Federation of Trade Unions. (2007). *Policy on Education in Botswana*. The

Botswana Federation of Trade Unions.

Bredenkamp, S., & Copple, C. (2009). *Developmentally Appropriate Practice in Early Childhood*

*Programs*. Washington D.C: National Association for the Education of Young Children.

Brouneus, K. (2011). *In-Depth Interviewing: The Process, Skill and Ethics of Interviews in Peace*

*Research*. Research Gate.

Bryman, A. (2008). *Social Research Methods*. New York: Oxford University Press.

Cevirgen, A., Aktas, B., & Kot, M. (2018). The Influence of Visual Arts Education on Children with ASD. *European Journal of Special Education Research*, 3 (2), 16-28.

Cohen, L., Manion, L., & Morrison, K. (2011). *Research methods in education (7 Ed.)*. New York, NY: Routledge.

Conrad, C.F., & Serlin, R.C. (2011). *The Sage Handbook for Research in Education: Pursuing Ideas as the Keystone of Exemplary Inquiry*. Thousand Oaks, California: Sage Publications.

Creswell, J.W. (2013). *Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative and Mixed Methods Approaches (4<sup>th</sup> Ed)*. London: SAGE Publications.

Cropley, A.J. (2019). *Qualitative Research Methods: A Practice Oriented Introduction for Students of Psychology and Education*. Riga, Latvia: Zinatne.

Crossman, A. (2016). *An Overview of Qualitative Research Methods*. Darrow Everett.

Day, M., & Hurwitz, A. (2012). *Children and Their Art: Art Education for Elementary and Middle Schools*. Australia: Wadsworth Cengage Learning.

Denbow, J., & Thebe, P.C. (2006). *Culture and Customs of Botswana*. Westport: Greenwood Press.

Denzin, N. K., & Lincoln, Y. S. (Eds.). (2005). *The sage handbook of qualitative research*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

- Devault, G. (2018). *Establishing Trustworthiness in Qualitative Research*. The Balance Small Business.
- Ditshwane, G.B. (2015). *Parental Involvement and Its Impact on their Children's Academic Performance in Botswana-Case Study of Two Senior Secondary Schools in Lobatse and Kanye*. Gaborone: Faculty of Education, University of Botswana.
- Dodiya, P., Kapadiya, J., & Malvaniya, M. (2014). *Classroom Observation: A Critical Analysis of Different Methods*. Ahmedabad, India: Faculty Department of Applied Sciences and Humanities, Gijarato Technology University.
- Essa, E. (2011). *Introduction to Early Childhood Education*. Belmont: Cengage Learning.
- Etikan, I., & Bala, K. (2017). Sampling and Sampling Methods. *Biometrics and Biostatistics International Journal*.
- Etikan, I., Musa, S.A., Alkassim, R.S. (2016). Comparison of Convenience Sampling and Purposive Sampling. *American Journal of Theoretical and Applied Statistics*, 5 (1), 1-4.
- European Commission. (2013). *Ethics for Researchers: Facilitating Research Excellence in FP7*. Brussels, European Commission.
- Flick, U. (2013). *The SAGE Handbook of Qualitative Data Analysis*. Los Angeles: Sage Publications.

- Fouka, G., & Mantzorou, M. (2011). What are the major ethical issues in conducting research? Is there a conflict between the research Ethics in the Nature of Nursing? *Health Science Journal, 5 (1)*.
- Fox, J.E., & Berry, S. (2008). *Art in Early Childhood: Curriculum Connections*. Executive Learning Corporation.
- Gardner, H. (1983). *Frames of Mind: The Theory of Multiple Intelligences*. New York: Basic Books.
- Gardner, H. (1993). *Frames of Mind: The Theory of Multiple Intelligences*. New York: Basic Books.
- Garvis, S. (2012). Exploring Current Arts Practice in Kindergartens and Preparatory Classrooms. *Australian Journal of Early Childhood, 37 (4)*, 86-93.
- Geddel, L. (2017). *Bushmen Painted Earliest Rock Art in Southern Africa 5, 000 Years Ago*. Live Science.
- Gelonch-Viladegut, A. (2011). *The Most Impacting Picasso's Quotations*. Paris
- Gentles, S.J., Charles, C., Ploeg, J., & Mckibbon, K.A. (2015). Sampling in Qualitative Research: Insights from an Overview of the Methods Literature. *The Qualitative Report, 20 (11)*, 1772-1789.

- Gunn, A.C. (2000). *Teachers Beliefs in Relation to Visual Art Education in Early Childhood Centres*. Christchurch College of Education.
- Hornby, G., & Witter, C. (2010). Parental Involvement in Secondary Schools in New Zealand: Implications for School Psychologists. *School Psychology International*, 31 (5), 495-508.
- Hussain, M.A., Elyas, T., & Nasseef, O.A. (2013). Research Paradigms: A Slippery Slope for Fresh Researchers. *Life Science Journal*, 10 (4), 2374-2381.
- Isbell, R.T., & Raines, S.C. (2013). *Creativity and the Arts with Young Children*. Australia: Wadsworth Cengage Learning.
- Ismail, N., Kinchin, G., & Edwards, J.A. (2018). Pilot Study, Does It Really Matter? Learning Lessons from Conducting a Pilot Study for a Qualitative PhD Thesis. *International Journal of Social Science Research*, 6 (1), 1-17.
- Jackman, H.L. (2012). *Early Childhood Education Curriculum: A Child's Connection to the World*. Wadsworth: Cengage Learning.
- Kaiser, K. (2009). Protecting Respondent Confidentiality in Qualitative Research. *Qualitative Health Research*, 19 (11), 1632-1641.
- Kawulich, B. (2012). *Doing Social Research: A Global Context*. London: McGraw Hill.
- Kindler, A.M. (2010). *Art and Art in Early Childhood: What can young Children learn from "a/Art Activities?"* Canada: University of British Columbia.

- Kivunja, C., & Kuyin, A.B. (2017). Understanding and Applying Research Paradigms in Educational Contexts. *International Journal of Higher Education*, 6 (5), 26-41.
- Kocer, H. (2012). The Evaluation of the Art Activities applied in Pre-School Education Programmes in terms of self-expression opportunity given to child. *Procedia Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 51, 289-295.
- Landreneau, K.J., & Creek, W. (2008). "Sampling Strategies." NATCO
- Lau, M.W.C. (2006). Strategies Kindergarten Teachers Use to Enhance Children's Musical Creativity: Case Studies of the Hong Kong Teachers. Queensland University of Technology.
- Lindsay, G. (2016). *Do Visual Art Experiences In Early Childhood Settings Foster Education Growth or Stagnation*. Australia: University of Wollongong.
- Mahgoub, Y.M. (2015). The Importance of the Development of Art Education Curriculum in the Sudanese Educational Institutions. *International Journal of Humanities and Social Sciences*, 5 (8), 99-104.
- Mahajan, H. (2017). *Research Methodology*. Munich Personal RePec Archive: Premier University, Chittagong, Bangladesh.
- Manti, S., & Licari, A. (2018). How to Obtain Informed Consent for Research. *Breathe*, 14 (2), 145-152.

- Mangwaya, E., Blignaut, S., & Pillay, S.K. (2016). The Readiness of Schools in Zimbabwe for the Implementation of Early Childhood Education. *South African Journal of Education*, 36 (1).
- Mannathoko, M. C. (2009). *Interpreting the New Lower Primary Art and Craft Component of the Creative and Performing Arts, the Botswana National Curriculum: Case Studies of Four Primary Schools in the South Central and Central North Regions*. An Illuminative Evaluation. Cardiff: University of Wales Institute.
- Mannathoko, M.C. (2013). Does Teaching Practice Effectively Prepare Student-Teachers to Teach Creative and Performing Arts? The Case of Botswana. *International Journal of Higher Education*, 2 (3).
- Mannathoko, M.C. (2016). Discipline Based Art Education as an Approach to Art Instruction: The Case of Standard Seven Curriculum in Botswana. *International Journal of Learning, Teaching and Educational Research*, 15 (1), 14-29.
- Mannathoko, M.C. (2017). Art and Design Discourse: A Critical Review of Botswana Lower Primary School Creative and Performing Arts Texts for Curricula Relevance and Alignment. *International Journal of Scientific Research in Education*, 10 (5), 590-600.
- Maundeni, T. (2013). Early Childhood Care and Education in Botswana: A Necessity that is Accessible to Few Children. *Creative Education*, 4 (7A1), 54-59.

Maunganidze, L., & Tsamaase, M. (2014). Early Childhood Education in Botswana: A Case of Fragmented 'Fits'. *International Education Studies*, 7 (5).

McArdle, F., & Piscitelli, B. (2002). Early Childhood Art Education: A Palimpsest. *Australian Art Education*, 25 (1), 11-15.

Merriam, S.B. (2009). *Qualitative Research: A Guide to Design and Implementation*. San Francisco: Josey-Bass.

Ministry of Education and Training. (2010). Education Statistics Bulletin. Maseru: Ministry of Education and Training

Mosweunyane, D. (2013). The African Educational Evolution: From Traditional Training to Formal Education. *Higher Education Studies*, 3 (4), 50-59.

Murphy, M. (2016). *Population Definitions for Comparative Surveys in Education*. Australia: Australian Council for Educational Research.

Mwamwenda, T.S. (2014). Early Childhood Education in Africa. *Mediterranean Journal of Social Sciences*, 5 (20), 1403-1412.

Naanda, A.N. (2008). The Development of Early Childhood Education within an Inclusive Educational Framework in Namibia. Cape Town: Stellenbosch University.

National Art Education Association. (2015). *Design Standards for School Art Facilities*. New York: National Art Education Association.

- Ndhlovu, D., Mtonga, T., Serenji-Chipindi, J., & Muzata, K. (2016). Early Childhood Education in Zambia: Inclusion of Children with Disabilities. *International Journal of Multidisciplinary Research and Development*, 3 (8), 126-132.
- Neuman, L.W. (2011). *Social Research Methods: Qualitative and Quantitative Approaches*. London: Pearson.
- Nijhawan, L.P., Janodia, M.D., Muddukrishna, B.S., Bhat, K.M., Bairy, K.L., Ndupa, N., & Musmade, P.B. (2013). Informed Consent: Issues and Challenges. *Journal of Advanced Pharmaceutical Technology and Research*, 4 (3), 134-140.
- Nompula, Y. (2013). The Marginalization of Arts Education: Optimization of Teaching Time Limitation. *International Journal of Arts and Commerce*, 2 (2), 102-108.
- Novakovic, S. (2015). Preschool Teacher's Role in the Art Activities of Early and Preschool Age Children. *Croatian Journal of Education*, 17 (Sp No 1), 153-163.
- Ntseane, P.G. (2004). *Cultural Dimensions of Sexuality: Empowerment Challenges for HIV/AIDS Prevention in Botswana*. Gaborone. University Of Botswana.
- O'Connor, J.B. (2014). *A Look at Community-Based Art Education through Multiple Lenses: The Potentials of Empowerment and Advocacy through the Arts*. Urbana: University of Illinois.
- Onwuegbuzie, A. J., & Leech, N. L. (2007). Validity and Qualitative Research: An Oxymoron? *Quality and Quantity*, 41, 233–249. Doi: 10.1007/s11135- 006-9000-3.

- Patton, M.Q. (2015). *Qualitative Research and Evaluation Methods: Integrating Theory and Practice (4<sup>th</sup> Ed.)*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Perham, M.F. (2007). *The Government of Ethiopia*, London: Faber & Faber.
- Pheko, B.C. (2010). A Conflict between Aims and Outcomes: Comparison of one Cohort's Primary School Leaving Examinations and Junior Certificate Results of 2003 and 2006. *Journal of Social Sciences*, 22 (3), 213-220.
- Polit, D.F., & Beck, C.T. (2010). Generalization in Quantitative and Qualitative Research: Myths and Strategies. *International Journal of Nursing Studies*, 47, 1451-1458.
- Price, J.H., & Murnan, J. (2004). Research Limitations and the Necessity of Reporting Them. *American Journal of Health Education*, 35 (2), 66-67.
- Rahman, A.A., & Alharthin, K. (2016). An Introduction to Research Paradigms. *International Journal of Educational Investigations*, 3 (8), 51-59.
- Republic of Botswana. (1994). *The Revised National Policy on Education*. Gaborone: Government Printers.
- Republic of Botswana. (2011). *Population and Housing Census Selected Indicators 2011*. Gaborone: Statistics Botswana.
- Republic of Botswana. (2012). *Education for All (EFA). National Action Plan (NPA)*. Gaborone: Botswana.
- Republic of Botswana. (2013). *Integrated Early childhood Development: Curriculum Blue Print*. Gaborone: Government Printers.

- Republic of Botswana. (2015a). *Education and Training Sector strategic Plan (ETTSP2015-2020)*. Gaborone: Government Printers.
- Republic of Botswana. (2015b). *National Education for All (EFA 2015) Review Report, Botswana*. Gaborone: Ministry of Education and Skills Development.
- Republic of Botswana. (2016a). *Pre-Primary Education Stats Brief-2014*. Gaborone: Statistics Botswana.
- Republic of Botswana. (2016b). *Vision 20136: Achieving Prosperity for All*. Gaborone: Botswana.
- Republic of Botswana. (2017). *Government of Botswana and United Nations Sustainable Development Framework (UNSDF) 2017-2021*. Gaborone: Botswana.
- Sarstedt, M., Bengart, P., Shaltoni, A.M., & Lehmann, S. (2017). The Use of Sampling Methods in Advertising Research: A Gap between Theory and Practice. *International Journal of Advertising*.
- Saunders, B., Kitzinger, J., & Kitzinger, C. (2015). Anonymizing Interview Data: Challenges and Compromise In Practice. *Qualitative Research*, 15 (5), 616-632.
- Saunders, M., Lewis, P., & Thornhill, A. (2012). *Research Methods for Business Students*. New York: Pearson.
- Schwandt, T. A., Lincoln, Y. S., & Guba, E. G. (2007). Judging interpretations: But is it rigorous? Trustworthiness and authenticity in naturalistic evaluation. *New Directions for Evaluation* (114), 11-25. Doi: 10.1002/ev.223.
- Shah, S.R., & Al-Bargi, A. (2013). Research Paradigms: Researchers' Worldviews, Theoretical Frameworks and Study Designs. *Arab World English Journal*, 4 (4).

Sharma, B. (2018). Processing of Data Analysis. *Biostatistics and Epidemiology International Journal*, 1 (1), 3-5. Doi: 10.30881/Beiji.00003.

Sikwibele, A.C., & Mungoo, J.K. (2009). Distance Learning and Teacher Education in Botswana: Opportunities and Challenges. *International Review of Research in Open and Distance Learning*, 10 (4).

Simister, N., & Garbutt, A. (2017). *Principles of Data Collection*. Intrac for Civil Society.

Starman, A.B. (2013). The Case Study as a Type of Qualitative Research. *Journal of Contemporary Educational Studies*, 1, 28-43.

Steber, C. (2017). *In-depth interviews: data collection advantages and disadvantages*. Communications for Research.

Thanh, N.C., & Thanh, T.T. (2015). The Interconnection between Interpretivist Paradigm and Qualitative Methods in Education. *American Journal of Educational Sciences*, 1 (2), 24-27.

The Arts Council. (2013). *Young People, Children, and Education (YPCE)*. The Arts Council.

The Qualifications and Curriculum Authority. (2000). *Qualifications and Curriculum Authority Annual; Report*. Great Britain.

- Theron, P.M. (2014). Coding and Data Analysis during Qualitative Empirical Research in Practical Theology. *In Die Skrifling*, 49 (3).
- Timmermans, I. (2017). Quality of Pre-Primary Education in Mauritius. Utrecht: University of Utrecht.
- Tshireletso, K., Makhabu, S.W., Nsinamwa, M., Kgosiesele, E., Setlalekgomo, M.R., Seletlo, Z., Majaga, S., & Legwatagwata, B. (2018). Diversity Patterns of Woody Vegetation of Kgatleng District, Botswana. *Journal of the Division Biodiversity, Evolution and Ecology of Plants*, 6, 415-424.
- United Nations. (2015). *Statistical Year book for Asia and the Pacific*. United Nations Economic and Social Commission for Asia and The Pacific (ESCAP).
- Yin, R.K. (2011). *Qualitative Research from Start to Finish*. New York, NY: Guilford Press.
- Yin, R.K. (2014). *Case Study Research Design and Methods (5<sup>th</sup> Ed.)*. Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications.
- Wong, K.M. (2007). *Early Childhood Art Education in Hong Kong: A Phenomenographic Study*. Australia: Faculty of Education, Queensland University of Technology.
- Yazici, E. (2017). The Impact of Art Education Program on the Social Skills of Preschool Children. *Journal of Education and Training Studies*, 5 (5).

Zuilkowski, S.S., Fink, G., Moucheraud, C., & Matafwali, B. (2012). *Early Childhood Education, Child Development and School Readiness: Evidence from Zambia*. Florida: Florida State University Libraries.

## **Appendices**

### **Appendix A: Interview Guide**

**RQ 1:** What is the role of art in early childhood education?

1. What do you understand by early child education?
2. What do you understand about art education?
3. How is art related to early childhood education?

**RQ 2:** What techniques do teachers use in early childhood education classes?

4. What methods do teachers use in early childhood education?
5. Are there any specific methods of teaching that you use in early childhood education?
6. What are these methods?
7. Are there any specific techniques that are predominantly used in early childhood education?
8. Are there any strategies that are used in early childhood education?
9. Do these methods used in early childhood education involve the use of art?

**RQ 3:** What challenges do teachers experience when teaching ECE through the use of art?

10. Are there any challenges that you face as teachers in teaching early childhood education through art?
11. What are these challenges that you face in teaching early childhood education through art?
12. How do these challenges affect your teaching of early childhood education and art?
13. How long have you been facing these challenges?
14. Are these challenges faced by your pre-school only or other pre-schools encounter the same challenges?

**RQ 4:** What suggestions can be provided for addressing the challenges experienced by teachers in ECE instruction using art?

15. Are there any strategies that you have in dealing with the challenges you face in ECE?

16. What are your suggestions of dealing with these challenges?

**Appendix B: Observation Guide**

Name of the Pre-school: \_\_\_\_\_

Activities undertaken

---

---

---

---

---

Expected learning outcome:

---

---

---

---

Teacher/pupil interaction:

---

---

---

---

Teaching in ECE classrooms

1. Use of art in teaching ECE

---

---

---

2. Methods used in teaching in ECE classes

---

---

---

3. Most predominantly use techniques in teaching in ECE classroom

---

---

---

4. Teachers understanding of ECE and art education

---

---

---

5. Resources available for use by pupils

---

---

---